Webinar Series: The Role of Vaccination in Maintaining Health and the Economy During Pandemics

Combatting Vaccine Hesitancy to Foster Resilient Life-Course Immunization Programs

2 March 2021  20:00 (Washington, DC)
3 March 2021  9:00  (Singapore)
            14:00 (Auckland)
Webinar Series: The Role of Vaccination in Maintaining Health and the Economy During Pandemics

Combatting Vaccine Hesitancy to Foster Resilient Life-Course Immunization Programs

2 March 2021  20:00 (Washington, DC)
3 March 2021  9:00  (Singapore)
              14:00 (Auckland)

Professor
London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine

Founding Director
Vaccine Confidence Project
Webinar Series: The Role of Vaccination in Maintaining Health and the Economy During Pandemics

Combatting Vaccine Hesitancy to Foster Resilient Life-Course Immunization Programs

2 March 2021  20:00 (Washington, DC)
3 March 2021  9:00  (Singapore)
             14:00 (Auckland)

Professor Emeritus
University of the Philippines Manila
President
Immunization Partners in Asia Pacific (IPAP)
VACCINE HESITANCY:
COMMON, SERIOUS, DISASTROUS AND AVOIDABLE

PROFESSOR EMERITUS LULU C BRAVO MD
UNIVERSITY OF THE PHILIPPINES MANILA
VACCINE HESITANCY IS A “DISEASE” THAT IS SPREADING GLOBALLY...

These are the 10 biggest threats to global health in 2019
Based on rankings from the World Health Organization

1. Air pollution and climate change
2. Noncommunicable diseases
3. Global influenza pandemic
4. Fragile and vulnerable settings
5. Antimicrobial resistance
6. Ebola and other high-threat pathogens
7. Weak primary healthcare
8. **Vaccine hesitancy**
9. Dengue fever
10. HIV

Source: World Health Organization

These are the most urgent health challenges to tackle in 2020
Based on a list of urgent global health challenges created by WHO, 2020

1. Elevating health in the climate debate
2. Delivering health in conflict and crisis
3. Making healthcare fairer
4. Expanding access to medicines
5. Stopping infectious diseases
6. Preparing for epidemics
7. Protecting people from dangerous products
8. Investing in the people who defend our health
9. Keeping adolescents safe
10. **Earning public trust**

Source: World Health Organization
Largest global vaccine confidence survey suggests that overall confidence in vaccines—including safety, effectiveness, and importance—fell in Indonesia 🇮🇩, the Philippines 🇵🇭, Pakistan 🇵🇰, and South Korea 🇰🇷 between Nov 2015 and Dec 2019.

hubs.li/H0vXTbc0
Six countries show significant increases in % of survey respondents strongly disagreeing vaccines are safe: Azerbaijan 🇦🇿, Afghanistan 🇨🇫, Indonesia 🇮🇩, Nigeria 🇳🇬, Pakistan 🇵🇰 & Serbia 🇷🇸—mirroring trends in political instability & religious extremism hubs.li/H0vXTbc0
% of people who believe vaccines are safe, by country and global region
Dark vertical lines represent region medians

Share of people who believe vaccines are safe (%)

Ukraine is one of several former Soviet states with low trust in vaccine safety

The highest trust in vaccines comes in developing countries like Bangladesh and Ethiopia

Source: Wellcome Global Monitor, part of the Gallup World Poll 2018
Global map of rising and falling confidence in the overall safety and general effectiveness of vaccines and importance of vaccinating children

(de Figueiredo, et al., The Lancet, 2020/Appendix 1)
Response rates to the query what are the top 3 reasons for not accepting vaccines according to the national schedule reported by countries in the 6 WHO regions over the past 3 years.

Hesitancy was common, reported by >90% of countries.
CONTRIBUTORS TO VACCINE HESITANCY

Reasons reported by countries for vaccine hesitancy classified in vaccine hesitancy matrix categories in the past 3 years.

- **TOP REASONS**
  - **DESIGN OF VACCINATION PROGRAM/MODE OF DELIVERY**
  - **RISK–BENEFIT (SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE)**
  - **LACK OF KNOWLEDGE AND AWARENESS OF VACCINATION FOR COUNTRIES.**
  - **INFLUENTIAL LEADERS, IMMUNIZATION PROGRAM GATEKEEPERS AND ANTI-OR PRO-VACCINATION LOBBIES**
RISK FACTORS

- Presence of anti-vaxxers, organized / bloggers isolated social media
- Politics
- Fund generation
- Scientific uncertainties
- Religious issues
- Conspiracy theories
- Bioterrorism

Frequency of main reasons reported by countries for vaccine hesitancy classified in vaccine hesitancy matrix categories by country income level over the past 3 years.

VACCINE ACCEPTANCE

• LOW RATES OF COVID-19 VACCINE ACCEPTANCE WERE REPORTED IN THE MIDDLE EAST, RUSSIA, AFRICA AND SEVERAL EUROPEAN COUNTRIES.

Vaccine Hesitancy major problem in the global efforts that aim to control the current COVID-19 pandemic.
CLINICAL MANIFESTATIONS

- VPD OUTBREAKS
- DISTRUST OF PUBLIC HEALTH OFFICIALS
- LOSS OF LIVES - MORE IN CHILDREN THAN ADULTS
- BREAKDOWN OF HEALTH DELIVERY SYSTEM
- EMERGENCE OF NEW PATHOGENS AND DISEASES WITH MUTANTS/VARIANTS

“alongside declining immunization coverage, the infants in the Philippines had substantial delays in vaccine receipt” \(^1\)

---

COMPLICATIONS

- LOSS OF LIVES
- LOSS OF JOBS - ECONOMIC BREAKDOWN AND DISASTER
- MULTI-AGENCY AND INTER-AGENCY FAILURE LEADING TO TOTAL SYSTEM COLLAPSE (WITHOUT ANY INTERVENTION)

47% of Metro Manila respondents undecided on COVID-19 vaccine - survey
TREATMENT/MANAGEMENT

COMMUNICATION

ADVOCACY

FINDING CHAMPIONS

POSITIVE CONVERSATIONS

FACTS AND EVIDENCE PRESENTATION
HOW PH IS HANDLING VACCINE HESITANCY
AND THE INFODEMIC
HOW PH IS HANDLING VACCINE HESITANCY AND THE INFODEMIC
Vaccine confidence cannot be increased by facts and education alone.
Understand values, beliefs & attitudes.

Changing Ways Changes Behavior

BRIDGE THE GAP

POSITIVE VACCINATION CONVERSATION

- Actively listen.
- Understand values, beliefs & attitudes.
- Don’t interrupt.

POSITIVE VACCINATION EXPERIENCE

- Personalize.
- Focus on facts you wish to communicate.
- Use open-ended questions.
- Acknowledge. Recommend.
Main reason for delaying vaccination is fear of COVID-19

We need to encourage more elderly to get vaccinated – cell phone text has been effective for child vaccination reminder.

There is no documented decrease in vaccination coverage.

Doctors sharing pictures of themselves in PPE and how safe their clinics are for vaccination would be reassuring.

It is an opportune time to remind everyone that there are many vaccines available for many diseases.

Missed doses, delayed vaccination, outbreaks will further strain in the healthcare system.

Republic of Korea
Main reason for delaying vaccination is fear of COVID-19

Japan
We need to encourage more elderly to get vaccinated – cell phone text has been effective for child vaccination reminder.

Hong Kong, China
There is no documented decrease in vaccination coverage.

Doctors sharing pictures of themselves in PPE and how safe their clinics are for vaccination would be reassuring.

Philippines
Perceived immunization level has gone down compared to pre-pandemic level.

Indonesia
Missed doses, delayed vaccination, outbreaks will further strain in the healthcare system.

Australia
We should not miss any opportunity to dispel myths on vaccinations

Sri Lanka
Take in consideration the lessons and experience in this pandemic – it is time for a global strategy.

Myanmar
Increase access points for vaccination to decrease need for travel.

Thailand
Home vaccination is possible!

Singapore
Measles outbreak would be imminent early 2021 unless vaccine uptake is increased
PREVENTION

• SURVEILLANCE AND MONITORING
• RESEARCH AND INNOVATION
• GOOD GOVERNANCE AND LEADERSHIP
The Asia Pacific region has a large potential to increase vaccine uptake moving forward...it has been done in the past, it can be done again.
Trends in the perceived safety of vaccines

Estimated percentages of respondents in EU countries agreeing or disagreeing that vaccines are safe

- Strongly agree
- Neither strongly agree nor strongly disagree
- Strongly disagree

Lines show mean values

Shaded regions show 95% confidence intervals.

Findings from largest study of global vaccine confidence to date finds that although confidence remains low across Europe, there are signs that it is increasing for much of Europe, including France hubs.li/H0w0gKb0

6:57 AM · Sep 11, 2020 · Twitter Web App
THE PATH TOWARDS THE SUCCESS OF THE COVID-19 VACCINE AND OTHER VACCINES DEPEND ON VACCINE CONFIDENCE. VACCINE CONFIDENCE NOW DEPENDS ON EFFECTIVE COMMUNICATION AND CAREFUL PLANNING.

Thank You :)
Webinar Series: The Role of Vaccination in Maintaining Health and the Economy During Pandemics

Combatting Vaccine Hesitancy to Foster Resilient Life-Course Immunization Programs

2 March 2021  20:00 (Washington, DC)
3 March 2021  9:00 (Singapore)
              14:00 (Auckland)

Vice President, Vaccine Acceptance and Demand
Sabin Vaccine Institute
Building knowledge about the drivers of vaccine acceptance

Kaitlin Christenson
Sabin Vaccine Institute
March 2, 2021
Our Mission

To make vaccines more accessible, enable innovation & expand immunization across the globe.
The reasons we see declining vaccine uptake in a given community or setting will vary; understanding and acting to address them is essential.
Vaccine hesitancy and acceptance occur along a continuum

VACCINE HESITANCY CONTINUUM

VACCINE HESITANCY
The delay in acceptance or refusal of vaccination despite the availability of vaccination services

VACCINE ACCEPTANCE
The acceptance of a vaccine or series of vaccines

The Range of Vaccination Behavior

REFUSE ALL
Refuse Some
Delay
Accept Some

ACCEPT ALL
Sabin and the Aspen Institute published a report in 2020 outlining ideas for meeting the challenge of vaccine hesitancy

- There is an urgent need to better understand the causes and dimensions of vaccine hesitancy
- Efforts needed to address hesitancy, even as efforts to understand it are incomplete
- Need to improve vaccination services and reduce access barriers
- Efforts to boost vaccination coverage must be coordinated
- A dedicated media strategy is needed, focused on role, impact of social media
Social and behavioral research can unlock new knowledge about the drivers of vaccine acceptance

Research grants explore such issues as impact of COVID-19 misinformation, vaccination decision-making pathways, and health worker perceptions.

Findings to date include:

- Strong social networks have significant influence on decisions.
- Community health workers with strong communications skills can increase vaccine acceptance.
- Critical to engage all stakeholders involved in vaccination decisions when generating demand.
- Vaccination program design and delivery should focus on trust, power, and social relations.
Social media platforms hold great potential to influence vaccine knowledge, attitudes, and behaviors

Social media platforms are a key resource for individuals seeking information and support for vaccination decisions.

Those who rely on social media for news may be more likely than traditional media consumers to be misinformed about the safety of vaccines.
A systematic literature review, to be published soon, focused on the impact of social media interventions on hesitancy.

This review explored the impact on vaccine knowledge, vaccine attitudes, and vaccine behaviors.

Overall the existing body of literature indicates that social media interventions can have positive impact on all three.
Additional interviews with key informants highlighted challenges and opportunities

- Lack of systematic monitoring and surveillance of social media leaves countries unprepared to address misinformation
- Industry and government policy related to vaccine content could take a more active role to stop misinformation and disinformation
- Usage of social media campaigns may be useful in countering vaccine misinformation or improving vaccine attitudes
- Limited ability to measure and evaluate how well social media campaigns are working to reduce vaccine hesitancy
- Future research agendas related to social media and vaccine hesitancy should leverage influencers and message testing
Recommendations to strengthen vaccine acceptance

• Assess and understand local drivers of hesitancy; identify partners with capacity to address them, including through social media platforms

• Equip health providers, who are often among most trusted sources of information, to communicate effectively about vaccines and immunizations to their clients and other stakeholders

• Include community members in vaccination program, policy design; understand the “vaccination decision-making pathway” and engage all key influencers when generating demand for vaccines

• Include targeted social media strategies in immunization planning (new introductions, campaigns, and routine)

• Maintain the availability of routine health services, including immunization, even during COVID-19 response
THANK YOU

Kaitlin Christenson
kaitlin.christenson@sabin.org
sabin.org
Webinar Series: The Role of Vaccination in Maintaining Health and the Economy During Pandemics

Combatting Vaccine Hesitancy to Foster Resilient Life-Course Immunization Programs

2 March 2021 20:00 (Washington, DC)
3 March 2021 9:00 (Singapore)
14:00 (Auckland)

Chief Strategy Officer
Immunization Action Coalition (IAC)
Leveraging immunization coalitions to unify the pro-vaccine message

Litjen (L.J) Tan, MS, PhD
Chief Strategy Officer, Immunization Action Coalition
Co-Chair, National Adult and Influenza Immunization Summit
Disclosures

- I have no conflicts of interest.
- I do NOT intend to discuss an unapproved or investigative use of a commercial product/device in my presentation.
Disclaimer

• The opinions expressed in this presentation are solely those of the presenter and do not necessarily represent the official positions of the Immunization Action Coalition, or the National Adult and Influenza Immunization Summit
Outline

• Increase in vaccine hesitancy in the United States
• The importance of risk communications and unified messaging
• The best partnerships are immunization coalitions
• Leveraging the coalitions to deliver unified vaccine confidence messaging
We Are A Victim of Our Own Success...

- Good success in our pediatric immunization programs has led to record low levels of vaccine preventable diseases (VPDs)
- In the absence of disease, the perception (and acceptance) of risk changes
We Are A Victim of Our Own Success...

- There comes a tipping point when patient concerns about adverse events outweigh what they perceive as benefits from vaccines
- Those concerns will ultimately lead to public detriment
- That time is NOW!
  - 46% of adults are unsure that vaccines do not cause autism\(^1\)
  - 1 in 4 parents believe that vaccines can cause autism\(^2\)
  - 1 in 6 caregivers of children with ASD believed that vaccines were the cause\(^3\)
- In many ways, the science is less relevant and risk communication is paramount

Changing landscape of public opinion

Medscape Medical News
'Disneyland' Measles Spreads to More States
Robert Lowes
February 09, 2015

Other views: Get rid of religious, philosophical vaccine exemptions

Disneyland Asked California to Say Report Says

OPINIONS

Fight the foolish: Tackling the vaccination crisis
February 23, 2015 1 Comment Tweet 

Johnathan Bowes
Columnist

We are not anti-science': mothers defend right to not vaccinate children

As some anti-vaccine parents fear recent measles backwash, a handful of mothers explain why they remain skeptical and unmoved by criticism

States move to toughen vaccination laws in wake of measles outbreak

At least 14 states have introduced bills that would make it harder for parents to gain vaccination exemptions. But one expert says the proposed laws focus on the wrong thing.

By Amanda Paulson, Staff writer | MARCH 3, 2015
Clusters of vulnerability!

Measles outbreak highlights the importance of adult immunization

By ROSANNA XIA AND RONG-GONG LIN II
FEBRUARY 12, 2015, 5:00 AM

Measles was once considered a childhood illness, spreading rapidly across playgrounds and parks.

But the national measles outbreak that began two months ago at Disneyland has added a twist to the highly infectious disease — that it is a danger to people of all ages.

By Lenny Bernstein February 5

Measles danger to adults overlooked

By Anna Edney, Bloomberg News
Bloomberg
FEBRUARY 2, 2015, 11:20 PM

WASHINGTON — The debate spurred by a measles outbreak linked to Disneyland over whether to vaccinate children for infectious diseases has overshadowed another vulnerable population: grown-ups.

More than half of the cases in the measles outbreak in California, which started in December at Disneyland and Disney California Adventure Park, have been adults, according to the U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention.
The anti vaccine lobby changes tact

Informed Consent/Personal autonomy appears to be the latest tactic for the anti-vaccination forces

Chiropractors lobby against bill ending belief exemptions for vaccines
So, here’s where we are

• Vaccines are safe and effective
• Vaccination is the social norm
  • This fact should be communicated nationally
• Work to understand specific reasons for concern at a local level and address concerns locally
• Most patients/parents do vaccinate. This majority should be supported and when supported they can be powerful advocates in their communities
• Methods to support providers to engage in conversations with patients/parents about vaccination are critical (strategies and reimbursement for time)
• Best practices should be collected and shared
• Messaging and messages matter
  • Narratives are powerful tools to communicate
  • Communicating the risks of not vaccinating is important
The Powerful Narrative

• Story telling is fundamental
  – Remember a story can be inaccurate and still change minds, and a story can be non factual and still move people...
  • This can be very difficult for researchers, public health officials, medical professionals to accept...
  – Denying this by trying to separate “authoritative sources” from “less credible” content, like stories breeds skepticism in the web
  – Need to propel our own narrative strongly
Voices for Vaccines is the pro-vaccine community’s response

Pro-Child. Pro-Community. Pro-Vaccine.

Voices for Vaccines (VFV) is a parent-driven organization supported by scientists, doctors, and public health officials that provides parents clear, science-based information about vaccines and vaccine-preventable disease, as well as an opportunity to join the national discussion about the importance of on-time vaccination.

Find out More

Because it’s the right thing to do.

https://www.voicesforvaccines.org/
The role of partnerships especially organized as a coalition

• Partnerships allow for coalescing of ideas and actions
• Organizing partners into a cohesive structure is one way to align
• What is a coalition then?
  – A coalition is a group of individuals or organizations whose members agree to work together to achieve a common goal
  – Members commit to an agreed-on purpose and shared decision-making to influence an external institution or target
  – Each member organization maintains its own autonomy
IZ Coalitions form in response to urgent events (vaccine hesitancy?), or low coverage

Supply triggers

**US:** Vaccine supply shortage in 2000
  → Triggered CDC and American Medical Association to form a coalition

**AU:** Media scare news in 1990/1991 led to sudden surge in demand leading to supply shortage
  → Triggered creation of Influenza Specialist Group…which became the Immunisation Coalition in 2016

VCR triggers

**US:** Low VCR in SE Asian refugees in local geography
  → Motivated local grass roots community leaders to work together improve VCR...becoming the genesis of IAC

**CA:** Low VCR in the older population in the 1980s despite public immunization funding in place
  → Motivated Ontario Lung Association to partner with a manufacturer on local public awareness and HCP education campaigns that were expanded geographically due to success, setting stage for coalition formation

**PO:** Consecutive VCR decline from 2005 – 2012 including years of Avian flu and Swine flu along with lack of reimbursement and loss of public/HCP confidence in flu vaccine
  → Prompted an NGO to lead coalition formation efforts in 2012

Graphics courtesy of Parallax LSC
Specific development pathways for each organization

**National Influenza Vaccine Summit (NIVS)** created by American Medical Association (AMA) & CDC to address supply issues

**National Adult Influenza Summit (NAIS)** co-led by the AMA, CDC and National Vaccine Program Office (NVPO) to be a more long-term coalition

NIVS and NAIS joined forces to create NAIIS

Expansion to include more diverse Private and Public entities

- Began as a small group in St. Paul, Minnesota to address lack of hep B screening and vaccination among Southeast Asian refugees in the community
- They were originally called the Hepatitis B Coalition of Minnesota.

**IAC**

- 1990: Healthcare workers and local HA
- 2000: Community members and CDC
- 2002: Continued to expand their network to include a wider and more national net of stakeholders
- 2004: Became a nationally recognized NGO that also manages the network of US coalitions working on education, as well as public policy

- 2016+: 700 partners, representing more than 130 public and private organizations
- Participants include professionals from the:
  - Healthcare industry
  - Public health sector
  - Private medical sectors
  - Vaccine manufacturers and distributors
  - Consumers
  - Others

Today

- Two major websites serve an average of 30,000 visits per day
- Weekly email newsletter sent to more than 50,000 opt-in subscribers
- In 2017, 4.4 million copies of IAC’s 200 English language educational pieces and 100 translation versions were downloaded from IAC’s website

Graphics courtesy of Parallax LSC
Coalition missions tend to focus on awareness, education, and programs that support coverage improvements of approved, recommended vaccinations.
Visit IAC/Summit Resources!

- **Read our publications!**
- **Visit our websites!**
  - [www.immunize.org](http://www.immunize.org)
  - [www.vaccineinformation.org](http://www.vaccineinformation.org)
  - [www.standingorders.org](http://www.standingorders.org)
  - [www.izcoalitions.org](http://www.izcoalitions.org)
  - [www.izsummitpartners.org (Summit)](http://www.izsummitpartners.org)
- **Stay ahead of the game! Subscribe to our updates!**
  - [http://www.immunize.org/subscribe/](http://www.immunize.org/subscribe/)
- **Voices for Vaccines**
  - [https://www.voicesforvaccines.org/](https://www.voicesforvaccines.org/)
Thank You for your attention!