ANNEX 12
INDEPENDENT ASSESSMENT OF THE ECOTECH IMPLEMENTATION OF APEC WORKING GROUPS AND SOM TASKFORCES:
MINING TASK FORCE (MTF)

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)	
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO SCE				
Recommendation to SCE1. Encourage MTF participation and input into the APEC Ministers Responsible for Mining (MRM4) whether taking place in 2011 in China or in Russia in 2012 in order to contribute to the evaluation of MTF's record, performance and standing in APEC since MRM3 2007. This should include a review and update of the ToR and the 10 APEC Mining Policy Principles and to examine the possibility of integrating the MTF with the EWG oil/gas fossil fuel sectors to form a new and unique APEC Extractive Industries Working Group (EIWG) that would considerably strengthen, broaden and integrate the vital mineral and energy sector interests of all the APEC economies. The EIWG would have two Task Forces, the existing MTF (minerals, metals) and a Fossil Fuel FFTF (oil/gas) with the coal sector spanning both the MTF and the FFTF.	Australia notes that that the Group of Experts on Mineral and Energy Exploration and Development (GEMEED) was originally an Expert Group that reported to the APEC Energy Working Group. It was found in 2006 that the issues addressed by GEMEED did not fit with EWG responsibilities in addressing regional energy security and as such it was split from the EWG. Given this, the EWG membership is unlikely to be supportive of this recommendation and any other recommendations that seek to re-establish formal linkages between the EWG and the Mining Task Force. SCE Members MTF and EWG should first discuss the proposed merger before SCE considers this recommendation. SCE to consider not supporting proposed integrating the MTF into any other entity such as the EWG.	SCE to encourage MTF participation in MRM4 and continue streamlining discussions with respect to MTF as agreed at SCE3 2011.	In time for MRM4 and SCE2 20112.	Yes, with streamlining of MTF to be discussed by SCE in 2012	
Recommendation to SCE2. Pending the outcome of MRM4 and its recommended review of the MTF standing in APEC, respond to the Leaders and Ministers instructions to meet the new challenges in APEC's mining agenda and if agreed recommend that the SCE endorse the		Review the outcome of MRM4	Following MRM4	Yes	

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO SC	E		
extension of the MTF mandate for a further 2 years and forward to SOM the request to grant the renewal of the mandate. In regard to the renewal timeframe it should be extended to a term (3 – 4 years) that would allow MTF plans and projects to be fully discussed and implemented.				
Recommendation to SCE3. SCE/SOM to take note of the MTF recent progress in the development of the MTF Medium-term Work Plan addressing Leaders/ Ministers priorities and government/industry perspectives in mining and metallurgy and its contribution to the APEC New Growth Strategy in capacity building, knowledge based mining, sustainable developments in mining and mining regulatory improvements, market transparency and trade facilitation and investment liberalization.	SCE Members SCE to review MTF's work in addressing APEC priorities	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes
Recommendation to SCE4. Through its Friends of the Chair (FotC) Club which consists of private sector mining industry representatives that provide necessary expertise and evaluation of MTF's activities identify an efficient way to convert relevant findings and recommendations into useful guidance in the strengthening of the MTF and in the updating of the FotC membership and achievements.	SCE Members FotC should be used by the Chair in a more regular and structured manner. Importantly, the comment that the "MTF is potentially one of the most business-oriented groups in APEC" should be harnessed and emphasised for leverage. The Chair and Vice-Chair, with the support of other member economies, should engage with industry to inform the agenda and make sure the MTF or relevant new Working Group is producing work of direct interest to the private sector. In this context, we also support the recommendation at MTF 13 under 5.2. The FotC group should be reactivated and re-invigorated under the Russian and	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO SC	E E		
	Malaysian chairmanship and vice-chairmanship of the MTF in 2012-13.			
Recommendation to SCE5. Economies are invited to contribute to the proposed APEC New Growth Strategy and APEC 2011 Priorities for achieving in particular Sustainable Growth, Innovative Growth and Green Growth and towards implementing ABAC 2010 Recommendations with regard to promoting post crisis recovery, facilitating trade flows, enhancing investment flows, ensuring access to labor and addressing energy security and climate change in mining. Encourage members to make presentations and publish their findings to raise the profile of APEC MTF's work.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO MT	CF		
Recommendation to MTF 1. Encourage all APEC member economies to actively and fully participate in leadership roles to develop the MTF Long-term Action Plan addressing Leaders/ Ministers priorities and government/industry perspectives in mining and metallurgy.		As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 2. Include in annual work plans, a set of targets and objectives, which can be used to measure the effectiveness of activities in contributing to the MTF, consider how the current year's priorities for MTF align with those in the medium term work plan and provide realistic timeframes for its activities and goals.	APEC Secretariat With respect to projects, revised project procedures approved by BMC in 2010 include as an aim to encourage the use of performance measurement in APEC projects and include targeted and measurable objectives that can be independently assessed. At BMC3, a paper on conducting longer term evaluations of APEC projects was endorsed by members and approved by SOM. The evaluation exercise is scheduled to commence in mid 2012.	As per the recommendation	2012 work plan onwards	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 3. In future, whenever a draft work plan containing the strategic priorities and directions of the MTF is being developed, a copy or copies of the document should be provided to other stakeholders and if appropriate to other relevant APEC fora for their expert opinion and input.	SCE Members The draft work plan can be circulated to stakeholders, so that their opinions can be reflected in the work plan. This is an excellent suggestion, as it enables the development of a comprehensive and clear work plan. Furthermore, it is suggested that each working group lists its major stakeholders, so that the working group will be able to request opinions from the major stakeholders as smoothly and rapidly as possible.	As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO MT	F		
Recommendation to MTF 4. Consider having templates or procedural documents for reference at MTF meetings in order to encourage more participation and contribution to the action items and the Chair needs to circulate all responses received.	SCE Members While a number of templates and procedural documents already exist, RET strongly supports the Chair playing a more active role and circulating all responses received from economies on relevant work plans, projects etc.	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 5. Define a leading economy to take responsibility for every MTF work stream, for example investment incentives, by planning and coordination of all relevant activities and focus on one or two to be implemented every year.	SCE Members A suggestion for MTF (MTF5) is that each of the major work programs will be headed by a leading economy. This suggestion is valid in that a program will be given better attention. The SMEWG has implemented similar action for advancing the SMEWG's priorities. Therefore, all working groups should have similar program.	As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 6. Strengthen the protocols and conventions for the Chair's leadership role to address pragmatics and transparency and an invitation to SCE/ ECOTECH to nominate a guest speaker for guidance.	SCE Members SCE to recommend be adopted as core condition for MTF work to continue We suggest the role and job description of the Chair be strengthened, and elucidated including a greater engagement with less active economies to ascertain their interests, and greater emphasis on open and timely communication as an essential component of responsibilities (as a KPI in itself).	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 7. Consider the socio-economic and cultural differences among MTF members and focus on issues of common interest rather than on economy – specific mining laws and policies and consider the MTF economies variations in terms of their mineral		As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO MT	CF .		
sector development in intersessional and meeting discussions that take care of all their interests.				
Recommendation to MTF 8. Consider establishing a dedicated APEC MTF website or portal for exchange of information, news, promotion and expert interactive advice and appoint a lead economy manager to maintain intersessional discussions on special critical issues that arise that can reflect MTF's timely responses.	SCE Members A website or database is time- and resource- intensive for all users, particularly given the need for updating to maintain relevance. Alternatively, we suggest a site with Economy Profiles be set up by each economy (with links to appropriate websites in English) – that would benefit all, and each economy could maintain its own component. Australian Government agencies already publish extensive information on geological information and production and trade data. We would envisage the Australian page of this site simply providing links to these sources.	MTF to discuss the feasibility of such a website or portal drawing on the APEC Secretariat.	SCE2 2012	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 9. Establish an APEC minerals database to cover high-level geological information and key market data such as production, consumption and trade on an agreed, consistent and comparable basis and should be complemented by capacity building in data collection and analysis in developing APEC economies.	SCE Members See comments under previous recommendation.	MTF to discuss the feasibility of such a database drawing on the APEC Secretariat and PSU.	SCE2 2012	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 10. Ensure that final reports are completed and approved for publication for each project in a timely manner and future project reports should contain a summary of the outcomes of the project and a list of recommendations for future consideration.	APEC Secretariat Under the guidance of the BMV, the Secretariat seeks to increase the value of information on outcomes (particularly capacity building outcomes) in project completion reports. Project Overseers are encouraged to examine the possibilities of building on achievements and	As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO MT	CF .		
	outcomes as a way of enhancing the sustainability of APEC interventions.			
Recommendation to MTF 11. Design a best practice MTF scorecard for each economy minimum standards for their action plan mining policies and operations and complete peer reviews of the current situation of the mining sector in member economies.	SCE Members This could potentially be useful but also costly. Further consideration is needed, including possibly as part of the agenda for the planned MTF meeting for February 2012 in Moscow. SCE advice would be welcome here.	MTF to examine the feasibility of economy specific scorecards.	SCE2 2012	Further consideration needed
Recommendation to MTF 12. Explore and identify funding sources including but not limited to APEC to sponsor MTF activities and propose more self-funding projects, workshops and seminars on key issues in conjunction with every MTF meeting.		As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 13. Work closely with the public and private sector and other stakeholders to insure that the MTF work is practical and focused on improving the business climate within and among member economies and encourage mining and metallurgy industries of member economies to develop business recommendations to the MTF Action Plan to make it more strategic oriented.	SCE Members SCE and MTF Chairs may wish to discuss with head of ABAC to progress a number of these issues.	As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 14. In regard to the world economic crisis and importance of mining sector for the economics of the APEC region underline necessity of further coordinated development of key themes of MTF: Market Transparency and Trade Facilitation and Mining and Sustainable Development.	SCE Members Note this is consistent with and may be relevant to work being pursued in the G20 on commodity markets.	As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)		
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO MTF					
Recommendation to MTF 15. Finalize analysis on the best practices in attracting investments in mining sector to APEC economies as well as develop a methodology of competitiveness.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes		
Recommendation to MTF 16. Promote Corporate Social Responsibility CSR awareness and capabilities in the APEC region and future work that will encourage dialogue among all relevant stakeholders including NGOs, civil society and indigenous people.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes		
Recommendation to MTF 17. Consider new special SD and CSR programs that are relevant to many MTF member economies including mineral exploration, mine safety, small scale mining, industrial minerals and sea floor mining.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes		
Recommendation to MTF 18. Identify key areas where capacity building and direct technical assistance are required and can be provided in mining sustainable development, corporate social responsibility and regulation compliance for the economies in need and explore additional resources from aid agencies, NGOs and universities that could provide training and other assistance.	APEC Secretariat Secretariat strongly encourages any efforts at clearly identifying and mapping out key capacity building and technical assistance needs in the sector. The potential to access external funding sources from multilateral and bilateral agencies, NGOs and tertiary institutions should be examined particularly if the capacity building needs cannot be easily funded through existing APEC funding mechanisms.	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes		

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO MT	CF .		
Recommendation to MTF 19. Identify pitfalls in practical mining operations including governance and the awareness of technological solutions and service providers and identify the role of the mining industry in the region's green technology low carbon development and pursue a low-carbon mining through capacity building.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 20. Recognize the special problems arising from the actual location of mining activities in protected areas and in indigenous communities.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 21. Explore the role of state and local authorities participation in the MTF in regard to the mining jurisdictions of economies such as Australia, Canada and the USA that are governed by the States and Provinces and in the case of Indonesia by even more decentralized local authorities.	SCE Members RET would be willing to explore contributions from and participation from its state governments where appropriate in the context of the relevant work plan and specific projects.	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 22. Collaborate with IEG, HRDWG, SMEWG, EWG, TPTWG, ISTWG and other interested APEC fora on relevant issues on case by case basis by the exchange of information, and consideration of possible joint project proposals, providing relevant expertise and invite relevant APEC fora to MTF activities and coordinate cross cutting issues to avoid duplication.	APEC Secretariat As a fundamental part of its role, the Secretariat encourages efforts at cross-fora collaboration to increase convergence and avoid any risks of duplication. We are examining ways of strengthening the exchange of information between PDs within the Secretariat to facilitate stronger dialogue on projects. SCE Members	MTF chair, SCE and APEC Secretariat to actively collaborate to achieve this outcome.	Ongoing	Yes

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO MT	TF		
	The rising importance of cross-cutting issues has ensured that this recommendation has been implemented already. However, there is the need to go one step further by creating a list of relevant fora for every working group. This means the fora of importance to a working group will be stated. There is the great likelihood that each working group will have different sets of collaborating partners.			
Recommendation to MTF 23. Inform MTF's progress to other APEC fora on related issues and organize activities on topics that interrelate mining with energy, industrial science and technology and investment and vice versa.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 24. Invite ABAC to identify stakeholders and institutions that would assist each economy to provide case study seminar on an agreed topic or on a need for their choice which is common across the region.	SCE Members This is an important recommendation that has the potential to assure greater relevance and targeted work being done by the MTF.	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 25. Encourage MTF members to contribute strategic letters to Ministers to consider improvements in processes and regimes which apply to mining as a communication strategy and each economy should upload their profile on their mining website.		MTF chair, SCE and APEC Secretariat to actively collaborate to achieve this outcome.	SCE2 2012	Yes

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO MT	ГF		
Recommendation to MTF 26. APEC funded workshops should continue to remain open to representatives from the private sector, as and when appropriate to enhance collaboration and capacity building activities and foster and encourage greater attendance and participation of non-APEC observers and stakeholders as guests at meetings to improve collaboration and integration of the MTF activities and include them on the agenda.	SCE Members Strongly supported	MTF chair, SCE and APEC Secretariat to actively collaborate to achieve this outcome.	Ongoing	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 27. Continue on-going work to initiate dialogue with European Union on the classification of nickel compounds as dangerous substances and its potential far-reaching adverse economic impact for APEC nickel producing and consuming economies.	SCE Members Australia has been closely engaged in this process.	As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 28. Continue to ensure its work agenda avoids duplication with other international fora, and remain focused on specific areas where APEC can add value. This could be done through the MTF's role in coordinating and facilitating APEC projects regarding mining sector across all APEC fora.		As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 29. Continue cooperation with the World Bank and facilitate contacts and exchange of information with ASEAN Senior Officials Meeting on Minerals, Intergovernmental		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
	RECOMMENDATIONS TO MT	T F		
Forum on Mining, UNCSD, International Nickel, Copper and Lead and Zinc Study Groups, OECD Steel Committee, European Commission. Collaborate with UNIDO in their development of cleaner production toolkits for application to mining in member economies, continue to monitor activities of international organizations in mining and metallurgy in which the MTF members are involved in to avoid possible duplication.				
Recommendation to MTF 30. Follow up the United Nations Commission on Sustainable Development (UNCSD) Review of Mining in 2010-2011 submission of the Report on Sustainable Development of Mining Sector in APEC, monitor and disseminate information on the review process and encourage member economies to exchange information about their strategies including any activities in other mining fora.	SCE Members Australia would support the formal adoption of the mining policy agreed at CSD19 in May 2011 (or at least the key elements thereof), noting that this text was not formally adopted due to failure to reach agreement in some of the other themes at negotiated at CSD19.	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012 and following MRM4	Yes
Recommendation to MTF 31. Consider establishing organizational contacts with ICMM and EITI internationally and with CCOP and SOPAC regionally as well as relevant NGOs and broaden stakeholder participation in MTF activities and recognize the role of NGOs and Environmental Groups in mining activities and share experiences.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)			
RECOMMENDATIONS TO MTF							
Recommendation to MTF 32. Encourage the APEC processes involved in allowing MTF members to attend relevant meetings and conferences and jointly sponsoring activities with other international organizations.	SCE Members This should be as a matter of an agreed norm to allow access for sharing information and knowledge transfer.	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes			
Recommendation to MTF 33. Encourage economies that are members of the ASEAN Senior Officials Meeting on Minerals and other regional mineral groups to brief them on MTF activities and invite their cooperation and collaboration on common issues.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes			
Recommendation to MTF 34. Invite small-island, non-APEC economies, in the Asia Pacific region with a developing mining sector such as East Timor and some of the Pacific islands, such as Fiji, and economies like Cambodia as an observer in MTF activities.	APEC Secretariat Participation of non-member economies in APEC activities is managed through the APEC Guidelines on Managing Cooperation with Non- Members" revised in 2010.	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes			
Recommendation to MTF 35. Continue interaction with mining and metallurgy industry through the Friends of the Chair (FoTC) group designed to be one of the main channels of communication with business and encourage wider business participation and encourage FoTC to invite the mining industry to organize an annual mining forum for input into MTC meetings.	SCE Members FotC should be used by the Chair in a more regular and structured manner. Importantly, the comment that the "MTF is potentially one of the most business-oriented groups in APEC" should be harnessed and emphasised for leverage. The Chair and Vice-Chair, with the support of other member economies, should engage with industry to inform the agenda and make sure the MTF or relevant new Working Group is producing work of direct interest to the private sector.	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes			

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)			
RECOMMENDATIONS TO MTF							
	The FotC group should be re-activated and re-invigorated under the Russian and Malaysian chairmanship and vice-chairmanship of the MTF in 2012-13.						
Recommendation to MTF 36. Prepare a FoTC annual report on the current situation in mining sector including major events, trends, and problems/issues of the sector, forecast for the future.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes			
Recommendation to MTF 37. Invite the GFPN (Gender Focal Point Network) to a future meeting to raise awareness of gender considerations and establish an ongoing collaborative relationship with this forum.	APEC Secretariat Secretariat encourages the attempts to ensure that gender concerns are addressed effectively – this is pertinent in the context of the policy directions outlined under the PPWE. SCE Members This is important, especially for community engagement and community education.	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes			
Recommendation to MTF 38. Encourage more female participation in meetings and activities and invite leading female experts and speakers. Include a section outlining consideration of issues relating to gender equality in all future project proposals.	SCE Members This is important, especially for community engagement and community education.	As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes			
Recommendation to MTF 39. Focus on gender issues in sustainable mining in relation to engagement by industry with communities thus having gender balance in decision-making committees		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes			

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or MTF	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE or MTF	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)			
RECOMMENDATIONS TO MTF							
Recommendation to MTF 40. Report results of MTF work to MRM4 Meeting on the short, medium and long-term programs that could assist mining industry development and how to best implement them within the APEC process and examine the need to establish a non-binding convention that MRMs are held more or less than every 3 years.		As per the recommendation	MRM4	Yes			
Recommendation to MTF 41. Identify the opportunity to hold Mining CEO Summit back to back with the next Ministers Responsible to Mining (MRM4) meeting.		As per the recommendation	SCE2 2012	Yes			
Recommendation to MTF 42. Follow up MRM3 agreement to increase the participation and employment of indigenous communities in mining and that industry address the mining skills shortage common to all APEC communities.		As per the recommendation	Ongoing	Yes			
Recommendation to MTF 43. Progress the MRM4 review of the MTF ToR priority areas to ensure that the directions of the MTF are strategic and responsive to current mining challenges experienced by the region.		As per the recommendation	Following MRM4	Yes			