

Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation

# Independent Assessment Report of the Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE)

SOM Steering Committee on Economic and Technical Cooperation (SCE)

November 2016

APEC Project: SCE/IA/2016

#### Produced by

Ms Louisa Minney Sustineo Group Pty Ltd 27 Torrens St Braddon ACT 2601 Tel: (61) 2 6140 4278 www.sustineo.com.au

## For

Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation Secretariat 35 Heng Mui Keng Terrace Singapore 119616 Tel: (65) 68919 600 Fax: (65) 68919 690 Email: <u>info@apec.org</u> Website: <u>www.apec.org</u>

© 2016 APEC Secretariat

APEC#216-ES-01.6

## **CONTENTS**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARYiii				
Overall conclusionsiv				
Recommendationsiv				
1. INTRODUCTION				
1.1 Structure of this Assessment	1			
2. BACKGROUND	3			
2.1 Method	3			
2.2 History of PPWE	4			
2.3 Structure of PPWE	5			
2.4 Terms of Reference of PPWE	6			
2.5 Outputs of PPWE	6			
3. ALIGNMENT OF PPWE WITH APEC PRIORITIES				
3.1 APEC's Main Objectives / goals	8			
3.2 Osaka Action Agenda (1995)	8			
3.3 Annual Leader Declarations	9			
3.4 ECOTECH Priorities	9			
3.5 PPWE Strategic Plan 2015 – 2018				
3.6 APEC Tasking Statements for 2015				
3.7 Current performance				
3.8 Discussion and Conclusions				
4. FORA OPERATIONS				
4.1 Structure and Operations of PPWE				
Membership arrangements				
Chair and Vice Chair arrangements				
Women and the Economy Program Director				
Meeting frequency				
Meeting management and documentation				
Project initiation, funding and management				
Communication				
4.2 Relevance of the Terms of Reference				
4.3 Discussion and Conclusions				
5. COOPERATION				
5.1 Cooperation with other APEC Fora	21			
5.2 Cooperation with other Stakeholders				
ABAC				

5.	3	Discussions and Conclusions	. 23	
6.	RE	COMMENDATIONS	. 25	
6.	1	Decision points for consideration by SCE	. 25	
6.	2	Recommended actions for PPWE	. 25	
Appendix A – APEC Working Groups			. 31	
Appendix B – Method			. 33	
Appendix C – Written Survey			. 34	
Appendix D – Face-to-Face Survey			. 41	
Арр	Appendix E – Source Documents			
Арр	Appendix F – PPWE Publications			
Арр	Appendix G – Detailed list of PPWE's Projects in APEC Project Database			

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

This is a report of the independent assessment of the efficiency and effectiveness of APEC's Policy Partnership for Women and the Economy (PPWE). The Terms of Reference for the assessment were:

- Review key Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) policy documents, including Leaders' and Ministers statements, PPWE records of meetings, key project documentation and activities to assess the outcomes and how PPWE supports the main objectives/goals of APEC and their impacts in APEC member economies,
- Evaluate whether PPWE is operating effectively and efficiently,
- Assess whether the group's Terms of Reference, strategic plan or operations could be modified to better respond to APEC Economic and Technical Cooperation (ECOTECH) priorities and contribute to the achievement of APEC goals,
- Identify ways to strengthen PPWE's strategic priorities and direction for future work,
- Provide recommendations on how the forum can better focus and more efficiently and effectively manage its tasks and assure that its capacity building activities are providing benefits according to Leaders' and Ministers' priorities,
- Identify ways to develop synergies among the work of the forum and other relevant APEC groups,
- Identify opportunities and provide recommendations for greater collaboration with non-APEC parties, including the private sector, civil society and other international organizations; identify ways for PPWE to tap resources for programs, and
- Explore how PPWE can better take into account the APEC commitment to give gender greater consideration in accordance with directions outlined by the Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy.

The PPWE was established in 2011 as the result of APEC's commitment to take concrete actions to realize the full economic potential of women, as outlined in the San Francisco Declaration endorsed by the APEC Economic Leaders the same year. The work of PPWE will advance "...the *Framework for the integration of Women in APEC*, based on the principle that gender equality is a cross-cutting issue within APEC."<sup>1</sup>

PPWE combined the former APEC Gender Focal Point Network (GFPN) (established 2002) and the private sector-oriented Women's Leadership Network (WLN) (established 1998), creating a single public-private entity to streamline and elevate the influence of women's issues within APEC. It was envisioned that the PPWE, a single public-private entity would elevate the influence of women's contributions towards economic growth and foster women's economic empowerment across the APEC region.

The PPWE is a policy partnership under the Senior Officials Steering Committee on ECOTECH (SCE). It is composed of members of the public and private sector from APEC economies, and includes women leaders, representatives, entrepreneurs and officials from government,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup><u>http://www.apec.org/Groups/SOM-Steering-Committee-on-Economic-and-Technical-</u> <u>Cooperation/Working-Groups/~/media/ED3456CD3FB64B9D9DC21585C6D73D08.ashx</u> Terms of Reference, Section 1 – Purpose. (accessed on 14 July 2016)

businesses, academia and civil society, who work with other APEC fora, the APEC Business Advisory Council (ABAC), and international organizations.

The PPWE is a conjunction of three components:

- 1. Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE);
- 2. Public Private Dialogue on Women and the Economy (PPDWE); and
- 3. High Level Policy Dialogue on Women and the Economy (HLPD on WE).

This independent assessment is the second in a series of independent assessments, with the first being completed in August 2012.

#### **Overall conclusions**

The PPWE is providing an effective and efficient mechanism to promote strong, sustainable, and balanced economic growth in the APEC region that is more inclusive and enabling for women to succeed and advance. The PPWE is achieving this with limited time and financial resources, and based on a Framework that was endorsed in 1999 and hasn't been revised since. In this sense, both the PPWE's Terms of Reference and Strategic Plan are responding to APEC ECOTECH priorities and contributing to the achievement of APEC goals, within the constraints of an outdated foundational framework. This is addressed in more detail in the discussion and recommendations that follow.

Despite these constraints, PPWE works successfully with other APEC Working Groups to collaborate and promote the PPWE vision. A good example is the Healthy Women, Healthy Economies initiative that is being implemented by the PPWE, Health Working Group (HWG), and Human Resource Development Working Group (HRDWG).

While there are opportunities for greater collaboration with non-APEC parties, including the private sector, civil society and other international organizations, PPWE needs to focus its activities on strengthening existing collaborations, in particular with ABAC; invest resources in reviewing the Framework that forms the basis of their work; and increase cooperation with other working groups through the promotion of gender transformative approaches throughout the APEC project cycle.

#### **Recommendations**

The following decision points have been made for consideration by SCE:

#### **Decision point 1**

To continue to promote gender as a cross-cutting issue, and to do so more consistently, across APEC through continuing to support the PPWE, which is well positioned to provide coordination, technical oversight, monitoring and reporting.

#### Decision point 2

To mainstream gender equity across the APEC project cycle.

Recommended actions that can be further discussed for implementation by PPWE are as follows:

#### **Recommendation 1**

That PPWE review the chair arrangements and consider implementing a 2-year chairing arrangement along the lines of the 'Consolidated Guidelines for the Rotation System for Lead Shepherds and Chairs'.

#### **Recommendation 2**

That a revision of the 'Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC' is supported by APEC and undertaken as soon as possible.

#### **Recommendation 3**

That a formal lessons learned process is developed for implementation within PPWE and implemented during the PPWE Management Council Meeting (PMCM) at the end of each WEF.

#### **Recommendation 4**

That the PPWE makes an annual presentation of its achievements, approach and work plan to a high level within APEC: preferably at SOM III, otherwise at the SCE.

#### **Recommendation 5**

That a representative from PPWE is highly encouraged to attend the meetings of other fora to present a progress report on the integration of women in APEC, and that likewise, all other fora are encouraged to present their report on their groups' progress in integrating women in APEC.

#### **Recommendation 6**

That PPWE develop and implement a communication strategy, addressing both inter-PPWE communication needs as well as extra-PPWE communication.

#### **Recommendation 7**

*That the PPWE components are collectively referred to as the Women and the Economy Fora (WEF).* 

#### **Recommendation 8**

That the PPWE work towards achieving greater gender equity in the WEF and engage more men as champions of change.

#### **Recommendation 9**

That private sector engagement in PPWE and HLPD on WE is increased and that the private sector have a greater degree of input in the development of work plans and the Statement.

#### **Recommendation 10**

That the PPWE engage more closely with ABAC.

#### **Recommendation 11**

That the gender-disaggregated data continues to be collected and recorded by APEC with a view to monitoring and analyzing it in the future.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

This report presents the results of an independent assessment of the APEC Policy Partnership for Women and the Economy (PPWE) to ensure economic and technical cooperation (ECOTECH) activities are targeted, effective, efficient, and make the best use of scarce resources. This independent assessment also recommends actions to ensure that the PPWE is responsive to Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation's (APEC's) current priorities and contributes to the achievement of APEC's overall vision and objectives.

The Terms of Reference for this assessment include:

- Review key APEC policy documents, including Leaders' and Ministers statements, PPWE records of meetings, key project documentation and activities to assess the outcomes and how PPWE supports the main objectives/goals of APEC and their impacts in APEC member economies,
- Evaluate whether PPWE is operating effectively and efficiently,
- Assess whether the group's Terms of Reference, strategic plan or operations could be modified to better respond to APEC ECOTECH priorities and contribute to the achievement of APEC goals,
- Identify ways to strengthen PPWE's strategic priorities and direction for future work,
- Provide recommendations on how the forum can better focus and more efficiently and effectively manage its tasks and assure that its capacity building activities are providing benefits according to Leaders' and Ministers' priorities,
- Identify ways to develop synergies among the work of the forum and other relevant APEC groups,
- Identify opportunities and provide recommendations for greater collaboration with non-APEC parties, including the private sector, civil society and other international organizations; identify ways for PPWE to tap resources for programs, and
- Explore how PPWE can better take into account the APEC commitment to give gender greater consideration in accordance with directions outlined by the Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy.

### 1.1 <u>Structure of this Assessment</u>

This assessment is divided into 6 sections:

- Introduction, including purpose and structure of the independent assessment;
- Background information on the study including method, and a short overview of PPWE and its history,
- Discussion on the alignment of PPWE with APEC priorities including: APEC's main objectives and goals, the Osaka Action Agenda, Annual Leaders Declarations, ECOTECH priorities, the PPWE Strategic Plan, and APEC's Tasking Statements,
- Discussion on fora operations, including an analysis on the structure and operations of PPWE,

- Discussion on cooperation including other APEC fora, stakeholders, and the APEC Business Advisory Council (ABAC), and
- Recommendations for improving strategic priorities and direction; recommendation for improving the operation of the group, including the improvement in coordination with other APEC fora, and the private sector.

This independent assessment is the second in a series of independent assessments, with the first being completed in August 2012.

## 2. BACKGROUND

The APEC PPWE is one of 19 APEC Working Groups and Policy Partnerships under the SOM Steering Committee of ECOTECH (SCE). (Appendix A – APEC Working Groups)

The PPWE was established at the second Senior Officials' Meeting (SOM) in May 2011 held at Big Sky, Montana, the United States. PPWE combined the former APEC Gender Focal Point Network (GFPN) and the private sector-oriented Women's Leadership Network (WLN), creating a single public-private entity to streamline and elevate the influence of women's issues within APEC.

The PPWE's Terms of Reference (updated in 2015), states that the PPWE will advance "...the *Framework for the integration of Women in APEC*, based on the principle that gender equality is a cross-cutting issue within APEC."<sup>2</sup> This is a reference to the *Framework for the integration of Women in APEC* (the *Framework*) that was endorsed in 1998. The Framework has a mandate to accelerate the integration of "women into the mainstream of APEC of APEC processes and activities" <sup>3</sup>, and includes an Implementation Strategy that shares the responsibility for the implementation of the Framework across all APEC fora. Specifically, "Because of its [*gender*] cross-cutting nature, and mandate for coordination and monitoring, the SOM has a major responsibility for ensuring the implementation of the Framework." In support of this, the PPWE Terms of Reference states part of its purpose as "provide policy and practical advice to APEC fora and Senior Officials to increase women's economic participation and drive economic growth in the APEC region."

This independent assessment focussed on the four years since the presentation of the previous PPWE independent assessment to the SCE in August 2012. The recommendations from the Independent Assessment prepared in 2012 were also taken into consideration in the completion of this report.

## 2.1 <u>Method</u>

The Method for this assignment is detailed at Appendix B – Method. It included a survey of member economies' PPWE representatives (Appendix C – Written Survey); face-to-face or phone interviews with a number of representatives of PPWE member economies and invited guests (Appendix D – Face-to-Face Survey ); and attendance by the lead assessor to the *APEC Women and the Economy Forum 2016* held in Lima, Peru, in July 2016. The online survey was consistent with the surveys undertaken for the *Anti-Corruption and Transparency Experts' Working Group* (ACTEW), *Agricultural Technical Cooperation Working Group and High Level Policy Dialogue on Agricultural Biotechnology* (ATCWG and HLPDAB), *Policy Partnership on Science, Technology and Innovation* (PPSTI), and in consultation with the Program Director for PPWE.

Appendix E – Source Documents includes a list of written sources that provided background to the purpose and activities of PPWE and the SCE. Documents presented to the APEC Women and the Economy Forum 2016 were also reviewed.

The draft assessment was submitted to the APEC PPWE Secretariat and Board for initial comments on factual matters and then was circulated to representatives of member economies. On finalisation and adoption by APEC it will be submitted to PPWE.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup><u>http://www.apec.org/Groups/SOM-Steering-Committee-on-Economic-and-Technical-</u> <u>Cooperation/Working-Groups/~/media/ED3456CD3FB64B9D9DC21585C6D73D08.ashx</u> Terms of Reference, Section 1 – Purpose. (accessed on 14 July 2016)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> http://www.apec.org/~/media/Files/Groups/GFPN/02 aggi framewk.pdf (accessed on 14 July 2016)

## 2.2 <u>History of PPWE</u>

The history of PPWE can be traced back to the 4<sup>th</sup> World Conference on Women in Beijing (1995) where an informal group of ASEAN women scientists identified APEC as one multilateral organisation with which to engage on the global community's commitment to engender multilateral and international trade processes. The Women Leaders' Network (WLN) was subsequently founded in 1996 and immediately proposed a list of recommendations to the Chair of APEC, Filipino President Fidel Ramos, including the following 'call to action' asking APEC leaders to:

- Recognize and integrate gender as a cross-cutting theme in APEC,
- Develop a partnership with the WLN to identify mechanisms to achieve this objective, and
- Recognize the WLN as a flexible, consultative forum and a strategic partner toward the achievement of the APEC vision, goals and action agenda (WLN 1996a).<sup>4</sup>

The WLN also directed its recommendations to three specific APEC Working Groups: Industrial Science and Technology (IST), Human Resources Development (HRD), and Small and Medium-sized Enterprises (SMEs).

Following the WLN proposal, *The Manila Action Plan Agenda* (1996), included a statement in which the leaders recognized women's role in the economy and the leaders' declaration incorporating a statement to their ministers to "put a special emphasis on women and youth".

All women in WLN were leaders in their own right and the WLN was a forum where women from all sectors engaged in developing policy recommendations that the policy makers could take forward on behalf of WLN. The WLN adopted a similar model to the APEC Business Advisory Council (ABAC) and presented its annual meeting Statement directly to APEC Ministers. The WLN remains the only women's trans-economy advocacy network to have directly and routinely engaged with an economic intergovernmental organization.

In 1997, APEC leaders pledged to "take specific steps to reinforce the important role of women in economic development" and hold a Ministerial Meeting on Women "to take stock of the progress to date in involving women in APEC's agenda and to determine next steps to integrate women into the mainstream of APEC activities". The first APEC *Ministerial Meeting on Women* was held in Makati City, Philippines in 1998. The *Framework for the Integration on Women in APEC* was endorsed the following year.

The *Ad-Hoc Advisory Group on Gender Integration* (AGGI) was raised and tasked with the implementation of the *Framework*. When the AGGI expired, APEC endorsed the establishment of the APEC *Gender Focal Point Network* (GFPN) (2002) to continue to advance and sustain the achievements made in maintaining awareness on gender issues.

2010 was an historic year. Japan, as host economy for APEC had elected a new government with a mandate for change, it coincided with: the timing for the first target of the Bogor Goals to create free and open trade amongst developed APEC economies; the 15th anniversary of the *4th World Conference on Women*, and a milestone year for the implementation of the Millennium Development Goals.<sup>5</sup> Building on this momentum the WLN recommendations to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> <u>http://hoilhpn.org.vn/NewsDetail.asp?Catid=151&NewsId=3492&lang=EN</u> (accessed on 18 July 2016)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Lever, Andrina, *Thoughts on APEC Women Leaders Network Going Forward*, Lever Enterprises, Canada, 2010.

APEC leaders welcomed the United States' proposal to hold a High Level Policy Meeting on Women's Economic Empowerment in San Francisco in September 2011.<sup>6</sup>

During the 2011 Senior Officials' Meeting held at Big Sky, Montana, in the United States of America, APEC economies agreed to take concrete actions to realize the full economic potential of women, as outlined in the San Francisco Declaration endorsed by the APEC Economic Leaders the same year. To streamline and integrate gender equality and women and the economy considerations, and elevate the influence of women's economic issues in APEC, the functions of the GFPN and WLN were combined. This resulted in the establishment of the PPWE. It was envisioned that the PPWE, a single public-private entity would elevate the influence of women's contributions towards economic growth and foster women's economic empowerment across the APEC region.

In 2015, the PPWE Strategic Plan (2015 – 2018) was endorsed, along with a work plan for 2015 and an updated Terms of Reference for the PPWE. The PPWE will advance the implementation of the Framework in the APEC agenda and promote women's economic empowerment through the five pillars: (1) access to capital and assets; (2) access to markets; (3) skills, capacity building, and health; (4) leadership, voice, and agency; and (5) innovation and technology.

The APEC Women and the Economy Fora has emerged as a conscious effort by women representatives to take stock of past achievements, identify present and continuing barriers as well as appropriate interventions, and support future aspirations for women's full participation.

## 2.3 <u>Structure of PPWE</u>

The PPWE is composed of members of the public and private sector from APEC economies, which includes women leaders, representatives, entrepreneurs and officials from government, businesses, academia and civil society, who work with other APEC fora, the APEC Business Advisory Council (ABAC), and international organizations. APEC actively involves these key stakeholders because it welcomes participation that:

- Facilitates the attainment of APEC goals through appropriate partnerships,
- Strengthens the quality of APEC's work by drawing on relevant insight and expertise, and
- Strengthens understanding and support for APEC's goals through openness, transparency and a broad-based partnership that seeks multiple perspectives from the community.

In general, non-member economies, organisations, business/private sector representatives, academic bodies and other experts may apply or be invited to APEC activities subject to guidelines. It is the responsibility of the Program Director to ensure that guests are invited in accordance with the *Updated Guidelines on Managing Cooperation with Non-Members*.<sup>7</sup>

The PPWE is a conjunction of three components:

- 1. Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE);
- 2. Public Private Dialogue on Women and the Economy (PPDWE); and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> <u>http://www.gender.go.jp/english\_contents/wln/pdf/proposal.pdf</u> (Accessed on 18 July 2016)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The most recent version of the Guidelines were discussed and presented in September 2015. See APEC 2015/SOM3/005, Agenda Item 12.4, Guidelines on Managing Cooperation with Non-Members.

3. High Level Policy Dialogue on Women and the Economy (HLPD on WE).

## 2.4 <u>Terms of Reference of PPWE</u>

During the 2015 PPWE meeting, member economies discussed the Terms of Reference and as a result it was amended. The revised Terms of Reference were endorsed and recommended by the 2015 SCE1 and the SOM approved them.

The broad purpose of the PPWE continues to be to provide a streamlined and effective mechanism to integrate gender equality and women and the economy considerations and elevate the influence of women's economic issues in APEC.<sup>8</sup> In support of this, PPWE is undertaking eight tasks:

- 1. Assist APEC fora and actively cooperate with them to identify and address priority gender equality and women and the economy issues within their work, including inviting the Chairs of the relevant sub-fora to the PPWE meetings to discuss issues that are relevant to each group;
- 2. Promote and report on women's representation across APEC and within individual fora;
- 3. Assess the use of gender equality criteria in project proposals, reporting and evaluation, revising the gender equality criteria, where appropriate and seek to ensure that at least one secretariat representative from member economies has specific gender equality and women and the economy expertise at all times;
- 4. Collect and share best practices in gender equality integration amongst fora and on an annual basis select one topic area of best practice to be featured at the PPWE meeting;
- 5. Support and report on the progress of implementation of gender integration within individual fora and across APEC economies, including following up on the implementation of policy recommendations on women and the economy called for by APEC Leadership;
- 6. Proactively engage with and share information to key members of PPWE, including private sector members and APEC Business Advisory Council (ABAC), especially the host economy ABAC member to be selected to be PPWE Women and the Economy advisor, as well as other relevant stakeholders, including international organizations, to advance women's economic empowerment in APEC;
- 7. Collaborate/assist in the development of project proposals in the area of women and the economy; and
- 8. Propose recommendations and areas of priority for advancing gender equality and women and the economy integration in APEC.

## 2.5 Outputs of PPWE

Although the SCE endorsed holding two PPWE Meetings annually, the PPWE has, on average, one meeting per year.<sup>9</sup> This is despite the majority of PPWE members' preference, and is more to do with the more practical constraints of time and funding. In 2015, two PPWE were held. Members reported positively on the momentum that was generated during this period.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> APEC, PPWE *Terms of Reference* (2015)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The Terms of Reference states 'if necessary'.

The Summary of each meeting and agreed meeting documents are uploaded onto the APEC Meeting Database (MDDB) site after the meeting. Specific PPWE publications are available through the APEC website.

## **3.** ALIGNMENT OF PPWE WITH APEC PRIORITIES

The independent assessment had a particular focus on how the PPWE supports APEC's main objectives/ goals and their impact in APEC member economies; and whether the PPWE's Terms of Reference, Strategic Plan or operations could be modified to better support ECOTECH priorities and achievement of APEC goals.

## 3.1 APEC's Main Objectives / goals

In 2014, APEC reviewed the progress made by its 21 member economies to improve prosperity in the Asia-Pacific by promoting trade and economic ties while addressing sustainability and social equity with the following specific priority areas:

- Advancing regional economic integration,
- Promoting innovative development, economic reform and growth, and
- Strengthening comprehensive connectivity and infrastructure development.

The important role of women was recognised across innovative development, economic reform and growth. In particular, the review noted:

APEC members commit to undertake concrete policies and innovative measures to further enhance women's economic empowerment and their access to markets and ICT technology, eliminate all barriers that hinder women's economic participation, and ensure women's equal opportunities, participation and benefit in innovative development, economic reform and growth.<sup>10</sup>

The 2014 Leader's Statement reinforced the recognition of the pivotal role of women in the development and prosperity of the Asia-Pacific, welcoming the recommendations from the Women and the Economy Forum and supporting initiatives including the APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard and the formal development of and APEC-wide women's entrepreneurship network. The Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC was noted as an APEC milestone.

## 3.2 Osaka Action Agenda (1995)

The Osaka Action Agenda provides a framework for meeting the Bogor Goals through trade and investment liberalisation, business facilitation and sectoral activities, underpinned by policy dialogues and economic and technical cooperation. This framework supports the implementation of APEC's 1994 Bogor Goals that aim to achieve economic cooperation and growth within APEC by adopting "the long term goal of free and open trade and investment in the Asia-Pacific."<sup>11</sup>

The purpose of PPWE as set out in its Terms of Reference is to promote the full and equal participation of women in APEC economies through the Trade and Investment Liberalisation and Facilitation (TILF) and ECOTECH agendas. The PPWE purpose is based on the principle that gender equality is a cross-cutting issue within APEC. The Terms of Reference states that in conjunction with APEC processes, PPWE will provide the vehicle for SOM to continue work on issues that affect the economic empowerment of women in the APEC region.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> APEC, APEC Outcomes and Outlook 2014 / 2015, p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> http://www.apec.org/About-Us/About-APEC/Fact-Sheets/Bogor%20Goals.aspx

## 3.3 Annual Leader Declarations

Since the establishment of PPWE in 2011, APEC Leader Declarations have included statements in support of a meaningful contribution to an increase in women's economic opportunities in APEC economies. For example, in 2011, in Honolulu, Hawaii the United States, the Leaders' Declaration stated: "...we commit to take concrete actions to expand economic opportunities for women in APEC economies. We welcome the San Francisco Declaration on Women and the Economy and pledge to monitor its implementation."<sup>12</sup> In Vladivostock, Russia in 2012, the Leaders' Declaration reaffirmed "our commitment to take concrete actions to increase women's participation and empowerment in the economy."<sup>13</sup> In 2013, in Bali, Indonesia, Leaders' committed to "promoting efforts to integrate gender considerations across APEC activities as a priority, including with greater private sector engagement."<sup>14</sup> In 2014, in Beijing, China, Leaders' stated: "We recognize the pivotal role of women in the development and prosperity of the Asia-Pacific."<sup>15</sup>

Each year, these commitments to increase women's participation appeared in the final "Looking Forward" segment of the statement or formed part of the "innovation" and or "inclusion" content. Then in 2015, at Manila in the Philippines the following statement appeared at the sixth paragraph: "We recognize the significance of enabling the full participation of all sectors and segments of our society, especially women..."<sup>16</sup>

Since the formation of PPWE, there has definitely been a marked improvement and more consistent recognition of women's role in APEC economies. For example, prior to PPWE, in both 2006 and 2007 there was no mention of women in the Leaders' Declarations, and in 2005 and 2008 the mention was only in relation to women having a "role".

## 3.4 <u>ECOTECH Priorities</u>

In 2010 APEC Senior Officials endorsed a new *Framework to Guide ECOTECH Activities* including APEC-funded capacity building and those of the working groups.<sup>17</sup> The framework adopted a holistic approach by revising APEC ECOTECH priorities and introducing a uniform set of criteria for all project funding, where funding is based on the link between proposals and APEC's core objectives.

Within this framework, the following medium-term ECOTECH priorities were established for the period of 2015-2019:

Cross-cutting priorities

- 1. Developing human capital through capacity building;
- 2. Developing and strengthening the dynamism of SMEs;
- 3. Harnessing technologies for the future and supporting innovation; and
- 4. Inclusive growth addressing the social dimension of globalisation, health, gender.

Work-stream priorities

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> APEC (2011): Leaders' Declaration

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> APEC (2012): Leaders' Declaration

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> APEC (2013): Leaders' Declaration, paragraph 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> APEC (2014): Leaders' Declaration, paragraph 43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> APEC (2015): Leaders' Declaration, paragraph 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> http://www.apec.org/Groups/SOM-Steering-Committee-on-Economic-and-Technical-Cooperation.aspx

- 1. Regional economic integration;
- 2. Structural reform;
- 3. Safeguarding the quality of life through sustainable growth; and
- 4. Human security.

In 2015, to assist with the development and implementation of APEC activities, the *Guidebook on APEC Projects* was updated to include an appendix entitled "Guide on Gender Criteria for APEC Project Proposals" (Appendix H). Under this guide, Project Officers should ensure their project maximises cross-cutting methodologies identified in the Framework to Guide ECOTECH Activities. Appendix H states:

Recognizing that gender is a cross-cutting issue, Leaders have charged the Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE) to lead these efforts and to work with other APEC entities to provide effective policy recommendations on women and the economy.

The PPWE acts as an institutional mechanism for reporting to the Steering Committee on ECOTECH (SCE) on APEC gender activities and outcomes. The broad goal of the PPWE is to provide linkages between APEC fora, APEC economies and the APEC Secretariat to advance the economic integration of women in the APEC region for the benefit of all economies.<sup>18</sup>

PPWE is achieving some success through implementing Appendix H, for example over the last year 17 of the 21 projects approved by APEC complied with the *Guide on Gender Criteria for APEC Project Proposals*.

## 3.5 <u>PPWE Strategic Plan 2015 – 2018</u>

In 2015, the PPWE endorsed the implementation of its first multi-year strategic plan (The PPWE Strategic Plan 2015 – 2018). This strategic plan outlines the PPWE's specific objectives for the implementation of the Framework for the Integration of Women (1999) in the APEC agenda. The strategic plan also seeks to advance women's empowerment through a number of priority areas. These priority areas were identified by APEC leaders in 2011 in acknowledgement that the economic potential of women remains untapped, and effort in specific areas is required to overcome the barriers and fully harness the economic integration of women in the APEC agenda. These four areas became known as the 'pillars', and were increased to five in 2012 in Vladivostok when Russia raised the relevance of taking into consideration women's health and human capacity. The five pillars are:

- 1. Access to capital and assets;
- 2. Access to markets;
- 3. Skills, capacity building and health;
- 4. Leadership, voice and agency; and
- 5. Innovation and technology.

The PPWE strategic plan is thorough and comprehensive. It includes important elements such as vision and mission statements, set objectives with targets, an analysis of critical success factors (or risks), and a comprehensive work plan delegating responsibilities and timings. The PPWE is largely on schedule with the implementation of the activities detailed in its strategic

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> APEC, *Guidebook on APEC Projects*, 2011, Appendix H.

plan. For example, the Dashboard (an output of Objective's 1 and 3) was published on time and reported on at PPWE in 2016. The Dashboard is a significant product for PPWE. It is the result of advocacy stemming from the original implementation of the Framework, which states that one of the three inter-related elements critical for reinforcing the important role of women in economic development is the collection and use of sex-disaggregated data.<sup>19</sup> However, as with all APEC activities, contributions are voluntary and whilst the Dashboard is due for review biennially, and it is undisputed there is great value in tracking this data longitudinally, PPWE cannot guarantee this will be achieved.

Likewise, implementation of Objective 2 is progressing strongly (women's economic participation through the five pillars). For example, the WE-APEC initiative was launched in 2016. This initiative connects business networks, the private sector and government services in the Asia-Pacific to support women entrepreneurs.<sup>20</sup> PPWE is also successfully implementing cross-fora activities, for example the development of the 'Healthy Women, Healthy Economies Toolkit'. This has been developed in conjunction with the Heath Working Group and Human Resources Working Group.

As with the implementation of the Dashboard, the success of both projects depends on the ongoing voluntary commitment and funding of the APEC member economies.

## 3.6 APEC Tasking Statements for 2015

APEC's Tasking Statements for 2015 proposed six requirements for the PPWE namely:

- Commit to stabilizing and expanding employment, implementing macroeconomic policies in favour of job creation, and strengthening capacity building for human resources development, vocational skills development skill training and youth,
- Make efforts to implement training programs for skills development for women and young people, fostering an enabling environment to create better quality jobs; establish capacity building centers to help workers achieve competencies required to meet industry demand,
- Sustain momentum from economies to provide policy support for women's economic empowerment and establish a gender- responsive enabling environment to advance women's full and equal economic participation, including in women's access to jobs, capital, markets, business networks, skills and capacity building, and innovation and technology,
- Take forward actions to launch a Women's Entrepreneurship in APEC (WE-APEC) entrepreneurship network,
- Establish the APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard as an important step in tracking women's ability to participate in the economy in the APEC region and task the PSU with producing the first Women and the Economy Dashboard in 2015, and
- Task the APEC Policy Partnership on Women and Economy (PPWE) to collaborate with other APEC fora to incorporate a gender perspective into APEC's work; and encourage cross-fora synergies wherever possible, including with greater private sector engagement, collaboration and sharing of best practice data.

Overall, respondents considered that the PPWE was addressing the APEC Tasking Statement requirements well. In particular, respondents reported that the PPWE collaborated very well with other APEC to incorporate a gender perspective into APEC's work and encourage cross-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> APEC, Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC, APEC, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> <u>http://www.we-apec.com</u> accessed on 20 July 2016

fora synergies. Respondents also reported positively about the *APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard* initiative.

Ultimately, the PPWE agenda is a cross-cutting one that sits awkwardly alongside the more siloed activities of the other Working Groups under the SCE. APEC is working to address these silos and in 2012, set out to realign with one of the organizing themes and priorities of the Manila Framework for Strengthening Economic Cooperation and Development of 1996, in which Ministers urged "Working Groups and other relevant APEC fora to coordinate with each other and integrate their work on cross-cutting issues to achieve focused outcomes and demonstrate breakthroughs in advancing the goals of APEC in the light of Part II of the Osaka Action Agenda..."<sup>21</sup>

As a result, APEC endorsed a 'Framework to Discuss Cross-Cutting Issues in APEC: Creating Effective and Closer Coordination among SCE fora'. This Framework sets out the relevant layers of dialogue within APEC and describes mechanisms for the incorporation of the cross-cutting issues. For example during the SOM Steering Committee on Economic and Technical Cooperation Committee of the Whole (SCE-COW), the Framework recommends *that Lead Shepherds and Chairs and Deputy Lead Shepherd/Chair of APEC Working Groups and SOM Task Forces will seek opportunities to increase coordination and interaction with other SCE-fora.* The Framework also recommends that the SCE-COW Policy Dialogue will *enable SCE-COW to engage in a constructive and in-depth discussion on a cross-cutting issue, create better coordination among SCE fora and with international organization, and identify capacity building needs and future work.<sup>22</sup>* 

Under current arrangements, PPWE has not been able to benefit from APEC's implementation of the 'Framework to Discuss Cross-Cutting Issues in APEC: Creating Effective and Closer Coordination among SCE fora'. For example, since its formation, PPWE has only been represented at one SCE-COW. This was during 2013 when Indonesia hosted APEC and where PPWE made a statement about what it is striving to achieve and how they can benefit other working groups.

## 3.7 <u>Current performance</u>

The survey sought feedback on significant existing or future initiatives that the PPWE could implement in addressing its Terms of Reference (Questions 1 to 3). The fields were specifically free text to gain an appreciation of how well understood the work of the PPWE is amongst member economies. The most significant initiatives are discussed below. Details of all responses are included in Appendix C – Written Survey.

The survey found that that the three most important PPWE initiatives to provide a streamlined and effective mechanism to integrate gender equality, women and the economy considerations, and elevate the influence of women's economic issues in APEC were:

- 1. To hold an APEC Women and the Economy Fora (WEF) every year, which would provide policy recommendations to other APEC Fora, SOMs and Leaders' meeting;
- 2. To update the guide on Gender for APEC proposals; and
- 3. Maintain the APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard.

Respondents considered the most important initiative to advance the *Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC* is to collaborate more closely with other APEC Fora and to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> <u>http://www19.iadb.org/intal/intalcdi/PE/2012/10990.pdf</u> accessed on 27 July 2016

provide them with assistance to incorporate gender perspectives into their work plans and further cross-fora collaboration.

Overall, respondents agreed that for PPWE to be a more effective mechanism, more funding needs to be allocated to projects that are gender sensitive, taking note that gender is a cross-cutting issue.

## 3.8 Discussion and Conclusions

Since its inception, PPWE has successfully elevated women's economic issues in APEC, demonstrated through the consistent inclusion of statements of support for the meaningful contribution to an increase in women's economic opportunities in APEC economies in APEC's annual Leaders' Declarations.

It has been more difficult for PPWE to integrate gender equality, and women and the economy considerations into the APEC environment. There are many reasons for this. Firstly, APEC recognises there are cross-cutting themes and issues, and that these are affected by a range of factors and require action across a broad range of areas.<sup>23</sup> Many APEC cross-cutting issues impact the work of a number of SCE-fora. APEC has agreed it has the institutional structures in place to address these cross-cutting issues. Therefore to achieve better coordination and a more efficient and effective allocation of resources, SCE has devised a Framework to Discuss Cross-Cutting Issues in APEC. Interestingly, the Framework to Discuss Cross-Cutting Issues in APEC doesn't set out what the cross-cutting issues are, therefore gender (amongst other cross cutting issues are defined as: Developing human capital through capacity building; Developing and strengthening the dynamism of SMEs; Harnessing technologies for the future and supporting innovation; and Inclusive growth - addressing the social dimension of globalisation, health, *and gender*.

Although gender is included in a list of cross-cutting issues, in practice it is difficult to promote, implement and administer as APEC fora function in silos and gender is not managed as a cross-cutting issue. Nonetheless, PPWE has been tasked with the responsibility of advancing the principle that gender equality is a cross-cutting issue.

Furthermore, the purpose of PPWE, as outlined in its Strategic Plan is to advance the implementation of the Framework, which was prepared in 1998 (published in 1999). The Framework is no longer in line with contemporary practices for the integration of women.

With no clear linkage nor articulation of gender at the SOM ECOTECH level, the cross-cutting issue of gender is isolated within PPWE. This leads into the second point. For PPWE's work to genuinely be cross-cutting, the work of the PPWE needs to be addressed above the Policy Partnership and or Working Group level with discussion being regularly undertaken at the SOM Steering Committee on Economic and Technical Cooperation (SCE) Committee of the Whole (COW).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> <u>http://www19.iadb.org/intal/intalcdi/PE/2012/10990.pdf</u> accessed on 27 July 2016

## 4. FORA OPERATIONS

This section covers operational issues that support the PPWE to meet its objectives.

## 4.1 <u>Structure and Operations of PPWE</u>

#### Membership arrangements

The PPWE acts as an institutional mechanism for reporting to the SCE on APEC gender activities and outcomes. The structure of the PPWE has been developed to support linkages between APEC fora, APEC economies and the APEC Secretariat to advance the economic integration of women in the APEC region.<sup>24</sup>

The key members of the PPWE are:

- Economy private and public PPWE delegates (as determined by each economy),
- Women and the Economy Program Director, and
- ABAC representatives.

### Chair and Vice Chair arrangements

The PPWE management arrangements differ to the directions outlined in the *Consolidated Guidelines for the Rotation System for Lead Shepherds and Chairs*, which stated that a Chair's term should be a minimum of two years, with a possible extension for two years.<sup>25</sup> PPWE's Chair is a government official from the host economy. The PPWE co-chairs represent the previous host economy and the future host economy. The Chair and co-chairs may invite private sector participants from their economies to serve as advisors. Interested members from other economies and ABAC are also invited to join the discussion at the PPWE Management Council.

In 2012, revised guidelines for Lead Shepherd/Chair and Deputy Lead Shepherd/Chair of APEC Working Groups and SOM Task Forces were circulated.<sup>26</sup> The revised guidelines continued to outline that each Chair will have a minimum two year term. Exemptions were available for this rule where approval by the group concerned and the SCE had been obtained.

The PPWE Management Council was created to sustain PPWE's efforts and the Chair and cochairs guide the efforts of PPWE. The host economy nominates one of their ABAC representatives, and the ABAC's Women's Forum also nominates a member to serve in an advisory capacity to the PPWE Management Council.

#### Women and the Economy Program Director

The level of assistance that the Chair can expect from the APEC Secretariat's Program Director are also outlined in the revised guidelines.

Program Directors are officially seconded by member economies to work for the secretariat for a period of normally three years. As their responsibilities may cover more than one forum,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> APEC, *PPWE Terms of Reference*, 2015, p 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> See 2008/SOM2/SCE/005, Agenda Item 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> 2010 APEC SOM Report on Economic and Technical Cooperation – Annex 4, *Revised Guidelines for Lead Shepherd/Chair and Deputy Lead Shepherd/Chair of APEC Working Groups and SOM Task Forces* and 2012/SOM1/SCE-COW/004 Agenda Item: 6.1 (a), *Revised Guidelines for Lead Shepherd/Chair and Deputy Lead Shepherd/Chair of APEC Working Groups and SOM Task Forces*.

Program Directors are unable to be a full-time assistant to the Chair. The Guidelines recommend that the Chair utilise the Program Director in a way that best services the group.

In the case of PPWE, the role is essential to sustaining gender integration across APEC. Therefore, the Program Director has significant experience in gender equality and women and the economy. In addition, PPWE works to ensure that at least one secretariat representative from member economies has specific gender equality and women and the economy expertise at all times.

## Meeting frequency

In line with APEC practice, the host economy rotates annually, with the forward plan being mapped out to 2023. Host economies determine the timing and location of PPWE meetings.

The Terms of Reference for PPWE supports up to two meetings per year if necessary, preferably prior to SOM III. The PPWE forum includes the PPDWE, PPWE, PPWE HLD and the PPWE Management Council Meeting (PMCM). The former three are concomitant to the latter but have no set sequence. Their sequence is determined and set by the host economy on an economy-by-economy basis, depending on the theme and agenda of the host economy. For example, in 2016, Peru hosted the PPDWE followed by the PPWE and PPWE HLD, and concluded by the PMCM.

### Meeting management and documentation

The suite of PPWE meetings are coordinated by the Women and the Economy Program Director. This includes the PPWE, PPDWE, HLPD on WE, and the PMCM. The host economy schedules the order and agenda of the meetings and also sets the themes. For example, in 2016, Peru set an overarching theme: "Breaking Barriers to Economic Integration of Women in the Global Market" and five sub-themes: Economy Care Systems - Recognizing, reducing and redistributing unpaid care and domestic work for inclusive growth; Costs of gender-based violence in the context of economic development; Mechanisms for the internationalization of MSMEs led by women; Financial and economic literacy and inclusion for access to capital; and Digital literacy for economic inclusion.<sup>27</sup> In the case of the 2016 APEC Women and the Economy Forum, the overarching theme and sub-themes set the scene and guided discussion.

Economies can bring delegations of any size. These can range from one person to over 20 people although there is room at the main table for only 2-3 people per economy. Generally the host economy takes the opportunity to bring additional delegates from the private sector.

The private sector is an important participant for the PPWE because the PPWE Fora is based on the private sector WLN initiative that reaches back over twenty years ago. In Peru, in the 2016 APEC Women and the Economy Forum, there was strong private sector participation particularly during the PPDWE. The PPDWE meeting format was energetic and accentuated by Ted Talks and a workshop on the five sub-themes. The ideas generated by the workshops on the five themes flowed on into the Final Statement. However, the following PPWE and HLPD on WE meetings were conducted in an overwhelming public sector format, and input from the private sector was largely subordinated to a public sector format and content.

During the face-to-face discussions, public and private sector delegates emphasised the importance of meaningful and productive engagement with the private sector. A high level of private – public engagement is an important foundational aspect of PPWE linking as far back to the Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC. With appropriate policies and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> http://www.apec.org/Meeting-Papers/Sectoral-Ministerial-Meetings/Women/2016 women.aspx accessed on 8 August 2016

programs, women's increased labour force participation and the growth of women's businesses will significantly contribute to the capacity of APEC economies to engage in and benefit from global trade. For PPWE to make a genuine contribution towards its vision of a strong, sustainable, balanced economic growth in the APEC region that is more inclusive and enabling for women to succeed and advance, it is critical that the private and public aspects of PPWE can both equally contribute and benefit from one another. In the current format, a satisfactory level of mutual benefit and gain is being achieved from the PPDWE, but the same level of mutual benefit is not being transferred across to the PPWE and HLDP on WE. Delegates raised possible solutions, which included:

- A parallel private-public PPWE where the public sector discuss their work plan input separately to the public sector and then meet for a joint session,
- Equal representation at the delegates table,
- Equal representation for the chair, and
- Greater private sector contribution at the HLDP on WE (especially at the chair).

Other suggestions included increasing meeting efficiency around the development of the Statement and less time to report on work plans resulting in more time to raise discussion.

During the face-to-face discussions, respondents commented on the difficulties that smaller economies have in hosting this fora. Smaller economies have tiny ministries handling the PPWE issues, for example in New Zealand there are only 26 people in the entire department, which also juggles other multi-economy fora.

Survey respondents reported favourably on the management of PPWE meetings. Overall, respondents felt that meeting ran smoothly, were relevant, and well matched to the aims and objectives of PPWE.

As it stands, the Program Director in the Secretariat is the central point through which information flows (mainly by email) in between meetings. The Secretariat also provides support and advice to the Chair, although the Chair may also have his/her own small secretariat to provide greater capacity. The Program Director will also attempt to keep delegates/economies up to date on other issues related to PPWE activities.

The reports from the discussions are hosted on the APEC Meeting Document Database (MDDB). Ideally, the Project Director asks for papers 10 working days ahead of the meeting, however documents often arrive late. Documents may also be tabled at the meeting. However information is not disseminated soon enough, particularly with regards to the activities that run in the margins (such as the workshops). Often the workshops would be of more interest to economies and their private sector partners, however, in some instances this information is only issued a week in advance by which time it is too late to organise appropriate levels of participation. At the conclusion of each meeting, the Secretariat conducts a classification of meeting documents and undertakes to have all meeting documents submitted by members prior to and during the meeting available on the MDDB within a week after the event.

### Project initiation, funding and management

With a mission to mainstream, elevate and integrate gender responsible policies and programs focussed on women's economic empowerment into APEC activities and a primary objective to 'strengthen the integration of gender responsive policies and programs across

*APEC fora*<sup>'28</sup> PPWE has an invested role in APEC project initiation, funding and management. To this end, PPWE monitors the implementation of Annex H: *Guide on Gender Criteria for APEC Project Proposals in the Guidebook for APEC Projects*.<sup>29</sup> PPWE has gained some traction through the implementation of Annex H, with 17 of 21 APEC project proposals being assessed as compliant with these guidelines. Whilst some inroads have been made at APEC's project proposal stage, this is not filtering through to project implementation. Recent Independent Assessments into the work of APEC Working Groups support this. As noted in the ACTWG Independent Assessment:

Active engagement on the APEC gender agenda was not visible through the work of the ACTWG. Gender issues are also not a separate part of the Working Group discussion and, in general, have not been highlighted in specific ACTWG activities or initiatives.<sup>30</sup>

And again in the PPSTI Independent Assessment:

...gender issues are addressed in the development of Concept Notes, and in project reports (noting number of attendees). However gender issues are not a separate part of the Working Group discussion and, in general, have not been highlighted in project reports.<sup>31</sup>

In addition to monitoring the inclusion and mainstreaming of gender in APEC proposals, PPWE implements its own projects. The full listing of projects is found at Appendix G – Detailed list of PPWE's Projects in APEC Project Database. APEC projects often include seminars, publications and research.

#### Communication

For many reasons, communication is a complex issue for PPWE. For the delegations working in this environment, good, efficient, and effective communication is a critical factor in their ability to implement and promote the PPWE agenda. First, the member economy agencies involved in the implementation of the PPWE agenda from within the economies are characteristically both under-resourced and over allocated with a diverse range of activities. Second, and building on the first point, while respondents agreed the secretariat is working hard to disseminate documentation in a timely manner prior to meetings and is prompt in publishing reports on the APEC website, information is not getting out to APEC economies in enough time. This mostly affects the smaller, less wealthy economies who depend on receiving this material in sufficient time to make decisions. Third, respondents felt that the current administrative arrangements are not meeting PPWE's needs. As it stands, the Project Director in the Secretariat is the central point for communication in between meetings. The Secretariat also provides support and advice to the Chair, although the Chair may also have his/her own small secretariat to provide greater capacity. The Program Director also attempts to keep delegates/economies up-to-date on other issues relating to PPWE activities.

For example, often the workshops are of most interest to visiting delegations, especially their private sector counterparts. At the time of drafting this independent assessment (in July 2016) the current activities listed on the website related to meeting outcomes achieved in 2015. The upcoming workshop and events did not contain dates and details for the June 2016 meeting in Lima, or the Workshops that were held at that time. For the delegations working in this environment, good, efficient, and effective communication is a critical factor in their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> APEC, *Strategic Plan 2015 – 2018*, PPWE.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> APEC, *Guidebook for APEC Projects*, 2015, p. 75

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Sustineo, ACTWG Independent Assessment Report, April 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Sustineo, PPSTI Independent Assessment Report, September 2015

ability to implement and promote the PPWE agenda. They get the information from the secretariat.

PPWE has an important external communication role. PPWE's external communication strategy is outlined in Objective One of the PPWE Strategic Plan 2015 – 2018. Targets include:

- 1. By APEC Economic Leaders' Meeting (AELM) 2015, publish first report of baseline indicators with a follow up [workshop or conference?] on recommendations for action in specific areas in the PPWE's five priority pillars;
- 2. By AELM 2015, disseminate results of the APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard workshop to all APEC for a;
- 3. By AELM 2018, evidence-based gender responsive policy recommendations are integrated into relevant APEC activities and statements, including across at least 10 APEC fora consistent with objective number 2; and
- 4. Annual Women and the Economy Forums conducted and statements disseminated and follow up action discussed in priority APEC fora, including SOM, SCE and working groups.<sup>32</sup>

Targets One and Two above have been met. Work towards the remaining Targets is ongoing.

## 4.2 <u>Relevance of the Terms of Reference</u>

This Independent Assessment undertook an assessment of the PPWE Terms of Reference against the important initiatives communicated by respondents in the survey.

Survey and interview data indicate that the Terms of Reference for the PPWE are relevant and promote the full and equal participation of women in APEC economies through the TILF and ECOTECH agendas. Respondents also agreed that through the implementation of the eight basic tasks allocated in the Terms of Reference, PPWE was able to provide a streamlined and effective mechanism to integrate gender equality and women and the economy considerations and elevate the influence of women's economic issues in APEC.

PPWE's annual High Level Dialogue was considered an important element in the effective promotion of PPWE's purpose. Conversely, respondents reported that the PPWE was not engaging as actively as it could to assist other APEC fora to identify and address priority gender equality and women and the economy issues within their work, or promote and report on women's representation across APEC and within individual fora.

Respondents, however, reported that while it is a worthwhile endeavour to advance the *Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC*, the Framework was written in 1999 and urgently needs to be updated to reflect advances in promoting gender equity and the economic empowerment of women in APEC economies.

## 4.3 Discussion and Conclusions

Strong, purposeful themes and sub-themes provide a useful reference point from which to manage PPWE and Women and the Economy Fora output. In the case of Peru in 2016, two particular sub-themes; Economy Care Systems - Recognizing, reducing and redistributing unpaid care and domestic work for inclusive growth; and costs of gender-based violence in the context of economic development, generated rigorous discussion amongst both private and public sector delegations. Most delegations presented compelling evidence and provided

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> APEC, *PPWE Strategic Plan 2015* – 2018, 2015, p. 1

a persuasive argument for the inclusion of these issues in the final Draft Statement of the APEC WE Forum 2016. This is a great result as these issues had previously not been linked to the overarching women and the economy fora.

The themes and sub-themes also vitalised the agenda and set the scene for the workshops that were run from the margins. These included:

- The 2016 APEC Women's Business and Smart Technology Seminar: New Value Creation of APEC Women's Business through Smart Technology and Leadership (Korea),
- Next Steps in the Women's Entrepreneurship in APEC (WE-APEC) (The United States),
- The APEC Women in STEM Workshop: Challenges and Opportunities (The United States); the APEC "Business Efficiency and Success Target" Award (APEC BEST AWARD) to women-owned SMEs (Russia),
- The UN-WOMEN photo exhibition on women economic empowerment, and
- The Export Fair of women-owned SMEs.

The wider APEC Women and the Economy Fora combines the efforts of the Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE), the Public Private Dialogue on Women and the Economy (PPDWE), and the High Level Policy Dialogue on Women and the Economy (HLPD on WE). These combined efforts are referenced differently, but mostly grouped as PPWE. This sometimes causes confusion, particularly within a private / public partnership context, and more so because PPWE strictly refers to the Policy Partnership only. There would be merit in promoting the whole agenda as the Women and the Economy Fora (WEF), which include three parts: the PPWE, PPDWE and HLPD on WE.

The Workshops on the margins, along with the sequence of meetings were productive and encouraged active participation from both the public and private sector. However, the PPWE and HLPD on WE outputs would benefit if there were mechanisms or a different structure that encouraged greater private sector collaboration.

PPWE has usually made do with just one meeting a year – despite the Terms of Reference making allowance for up to two meetings per year, if necessary. In 2015, the Philippines hosted two meetings, the earlier one of which was held in PNG to support their preparation for hosting in 2018. Respondents reported favourably on this initiative. Firstly, it was a good opportunity for PNG to practice hosting an APEC fora in a scaled down environment, but more importantly, in the 2015 Philippines-hosted year, PPWE was able to make strong progress towards meeting its targets. For example in 2015 PPWE was able to endorse its Strategic Plan, and implement the Dashboard. Both of these initiatives had a positive impact on PPWE outputs. The progress made towards PPWE's desired outputs during the years in which it has hosted 2 meetings, demonstrate the value of holding two meetings per year as stated in the Terms of Reference. The second meeting needn't be complex as the act of 'meeting' in itself provides the impetus and momentum to complete outputs.

The capacity of economies to support PPWE is limited, and there is reluctance to host two meetings a year. Economies are already juggling their capacity to provide the necessary offline support to complete PPWE outputs (for example an update of the Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC). This is likely to always affect the PPWE Fora, however there are initiatives that could reduce the pressure on the already stretched capacity of those involved. The most important step would be to review the chair arrangements and consider implementing a 2-year chairing arrangement along the lines of the *Consolidated Guidelines for the Rotation System for Lead Shepherds and Chairs*. This would increase efficiency through many aspects including: PPWE outputs would benefit from the oversight of a more experienced chair, the 'Chairing' economy could mentor the hosting economy (if required), which would be of great benefit to the less-experienced and smaller economies; transitioning the issues from year-to-year would be more seamless; PPWE outputs would benefit from creating greater corporate memory; and the host economy would be able to concentrate on the logistic and administrative issues relating to hosting.

The capacity of economies to both host and participate in PPWE would also benefit from the implementation of a simple Lessons Learned process that could form part of the PMCM. The Lessons Learned data could be stored with the PPWE Director and could consist of a simple excel spread sheet that could build on categories across a range of PPWE lessons including: scheduling, themes, integration of the private sector.

Lessons Learned data needs to form part of a greater communication framework. PPWE would benefit through the development and implementation of an efficient publicity and communications strategy both within Member Economies and across APEC Fora to elevate recognition on gender achievements. This conclusion was also reached by the Independent Assessment of 2012.

The foundational piece at the heart of PPWE function is the *Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC*. However, this Framework has not been updated since it was written in 1999. Back then, the Framework was seen as a means for accelerating the progress of integrating women in the mainstream of APEC processes and activities. The Framework sought to achieve this acceleration by reinforcing the important role of women in economic development through three inter-related elements being: gender analysis, collection and use of sexdisaggregated data, and involvement of women in APEC. While the Framework was a trailblazer in its day, there is now a much greater sophistication in how we understand and increase women's participation. The PPWE, however, is unable to harness these important developments because its purpose is to advance the Framework. For example, the importance of mainstreaming transformative gender approaches across the whole APEC project cycle. This is a significant missed opportunity for APEC which otherwise, leads other regions in nearly all data sets relating to increasing women's participation in the economy.

## 5. COOPERATION

This section explores cooperation by PPWE with other APEC fora. The assessment was required to identify opportunities for greater collaboration with non-APEC parties, including the private sector, civil society and other international organizations; and ways for PPWE to tap resources for its programs.

## 5.1 <u>Cooperation with other APEC Fora</u>

Gender is a cross-cutting issue within APEC, therefore cooperation with other APEC Fora is a critical element of PPWE's work. This is specifically expressed throughout PPWE policy and guiding documentation. For example, the first of PPWE's eight tasks outlined in its Terms of Reference is to assist APEC fora and *actively cooperate* with them to identify and access priority gender equality and women and the economy issues within their work. The first objective detailed in the PPWE Strategic Plan 2015 - 2018 is to strengthen the integration of gender responsive policies and programs *across APEC Fora*. The second objective of the Strategic Plan is to advance economic participation with set targets to incrementally *increase cooperation* in order to achieve the PPWE objectives.

The importance of cooperation with other APEC Fora is also implicit in PPWE's vision, being: *Strong, sustainable, balanced economic growth... that is more inclusive and enabling for women.* PPWE's Strategic Plan also cites cooperation as a critical success factor through which PPWE can secure buy-in and commitment on gender issues.

PPWE is working to increase cooperation through a number of mechanisms. First, PPWE has developed and implemented a *Guide on Gender Criteria for APEC Project Proposals*. These guidelines describe how gender can be implemented across APEC program by asking that proposals demonstrate how their project will benefit women, in particular will not disadvantage women; and require the proposal to describe how it intends to include women and women's perspectives in the design, implementation and evaluation of the project.<sup>33</sup> While PPWE is making some headway in integrating gender considerations into APEC project proposals, it is difficult to sustain gender considerations further up the line with many APEC projects not applying the steps outlined in their proposals during project implementation and evaluation. Nonetheless, the APEC Secretariat maintains gender expertise on staff to advise and assist, and PPWE is also available to provide advice to advance the integration of women in APEC. In the near future, PPWE intends to undertake substantial revisions to the *Guide on Gender Criteria for APEC Project Proposals*, which would require each proposing economy to take into account the five priority areas recognized by the PPWE to integrate a gender perspective in their proposed project.

Second, PPWE is working effectively to develop and implement projects specifically aimed to promote cooperation. For example, The *APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard* is an initiative that seeks to provide a snapshot of the status of women in APEC, by looking at a set of indicators, to measure the progress of women's participation in economic-related activities and women's inclusion across several aspects of life. The Dashboard is comprised of almost 80 indicators, classified in five areas previously identified as priorities by the APEC Policy Partnership of Women and the Economy (PPWE):

- 1. Access to capital and assets;
- 2. Access to markets;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> APEC, Guide on Gender Criteria for APEC Project Proposals, 2015, p. 2

- 3. Skills, capacity-building and health;
- 4. Leadership, voice and agency; and
- 5. Innovation and technology.<sup>34</sup>

This is a major initiative by PPWE designed to provide an evidence base to increase cooperation. As a result of this work, PPWE will have an evidence-base to determine the areas where more work is needed within APEC to allow women equal opportunities in the market.

As seen in the Dashboard, conditions for women differ across APEC economies and areas. In this sense, APEC could carry out capacity-building activities, in which champion economies in the relevant areas could share their experience with other interested APEC member economies, and provide advice in the implementation of reforms to improve the conditions women are currently facing. These capacity-building activities could be complemented with the preparation of action plans, listing a series of policies, to promote the participation of women in the economy.<sup>35</sup>

Lastly, PPWE cooperates directly with other working groups. One notable example of cooperation across three working groups is the United States-led Healthy Women, Healthy Economies initiative. This initiative is being implemented together with PPWE, Health Working Group (HWG), and Human Resource Development Working Group (HRDWG). The Project aims to develop a "Checklist for Improving Women's Economic Participation through Better Health" of policy recommendations and corresponding performance metrics.

There are high levels of cooperation between PPPWE and the Small to Medium Enterprises Working Group, and HRDWG. Respondent reported that this is because APEC is a platform for economic issues and that SMEs, which accounts for more than 10% of the enterprises in the region, play a vital role in APEC. Additionally, women are important human resources, a driving force of regional economic development, and their health is closely related to the sustainable development of APEC. Respondents also commented that a gender perspective to human resources development process is essential to realize inclusive and sustainable economic growth. PPWE is also co-operating well with the HWG and the Policy Partnership on Science, Technology and Innovation Working Group.<sup>36</sup> The traction that PPWE maintains with these particular working groups reflects the historical areas of interest for the PPWE agenda, dating back to the work of the WLN in the late nineties. It is clear that the long investment of PPWE in these issues has fostered high levels of cooperation.

On the contrary, PPWE respondents rated levels of cooperation with the Tourism, Energy, Oceans and Fisheries, and Illegal Logging Working Groups as very low.

During the 2016 PPWE and HLPD on WE a number of delegates from other working groups participated. This included members from the HWG, the HRDWG and the Small and Medium Enterprises Working Group.

### 5.2 <u>Cooperation with other Stakeholders</u>

Since its inception, PPWE has consistently and successfully co-operated with other stakeholders. Specifically, PPWE has very strong levels of cooperation with women in business and industry organisations, and women's chambers of commerce and industry. While there is no prescribed methodology for engaging with the private sector, economies utilise different

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> APEC, The APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard, 2015, p. i

<sup>35</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> The impressions of PPWE respondents do not reflect the impressions reported on by the Independent Assessor for PPSTI.

initiatives to engage and co-operate. For example, some economies call for expressions of interest, and make a selection based on succession planning. In Peru in 2016, the Women Entrepreneurs Development Commission of the Lima Chamber of Commerce worked closely with the private sector and the high level of cooperation was evident, particularly during the PPDWE and during the workshops in the margins.

Another notable example of PPWE's strong cooperation with the private sector was the APEC Women's Leadership Forum in 2013 and 2014. This event was held by ABAC Chinese member Ms. Wong Shutong, who invited political business and academic sectors in APEC as well as NGOs to promote women's equal participation in economy.

## ABAC

The APEC Business Advisory Council (ABAC) is the private sector arm of APEC. ABAC was established in 1995 to advise APEC officials on issues of interest to business. ABAC also responds to requests from various APEC sub-groups for information about the business perspective on specific areas of cooperation. ABAC has 4 meetings a year with the final meeting in the host economy and in the same location as the Leaders Dialogue, so that they can meet the leaders that have appointed them. There used to be a women's function under ABAC, however, now gender initiatives sit within the small to medium enterprise function of ABAC.

ABAC is an active participant in PPWE, mainly through the public-private dialogue. ABAC reports that the existing engagement of ABAC in the PPWE is very satisfactory particularly because ABAC is represented at the PMCM and therefore involved in discussions on relevant issues related to the execution and effectiveness of PPWE are discussed. PPWE is also successful in providing mechanisms for informal communication among ABAC and business delegations.

Respondents considered that cooperation with ABAC would improve if there was a stronger communication mechanism between ABAC and PPWE so that PPWE could share potential joint activities to avoid duplication of effort, and to cover wider scope of audience in advancing women's economic participation in APEC. Respondents would also value greater input from ABAC regarding recommendations on experts and entrepreneurs to participate in PPDWE, PPWE and workshops. Private sector respondents felt there should be more businesses involved in the dialogue with a greater level of engagement. Respondents also felt there needed to be more time in the agenda for discussion and greater replication of the way industry acts: more agile and interactive.

## 5.3 Discussions and Conclusions

Cooperation is a critical factor in the successful implementation of the PPWE agenda. Where PPWE has historical reference, such as with the Small to Medium Enterprise Working Group and HRDWG it has managed to build and maintain a high level of cooperation. In areas where there is less historical reference, such as Tourism, there are lessor degrees of cooperation. It is important for PPWE to gain greater traction across the wider APEC agenda so it can meet its objectives. For example, it was positive to observe participants from three other Working Groups in the PPWE, and would be more optimal if each working group sent a representative. This needs to work both ways and PPWE also needs to nominate a representative to participate on the other APEC working groups. In the past PPWE has participated in the SCE COW, which has been a successful approach in spreading a message to a wide and relevant audience in one session.

PPWE has been engaging in multiple areas to increase inter-fora cooperation in its agenda. The inclusion of the *Guide on Gender Criteria for APEC Project Proposals* at Annex H of the

*Guidebook on APEC Projects*.<sup>37</sup> However, the Guide on Gender Criteria only applies to proposals and has not been integrated across the project cycle. Notably, the Guidebook itself does not mainstream gender (with the exception of Annex H) and gender is not described as a cross-cutting issue, rather a cross-cutting methodology.

Cooperation outside of the APEC environment has generally been strong and now opportunities exist to engage with a broader perspective including members of the NGO and academic communities.

In many instances, the larger economies have developed some good approaches to cooperating and engaging with the private sector. The smaller and more resource-poor economies would benefit if this experience were shared, as some have struggled to find time to work out how to engage more meaningfully.

Cooperation needs to go both ways, for example PPWE needs to engage more with ABAC. In 2016, PPWE engagement with ABAC was good, evidenced by the higher level of profile that ABAC obtained in the final Draft Statement. Specifically, there are some very powerful women involved in ABAC whose experience could be drawn from for PPWE. Additionally, ABAC input into the PPWE program would be of mutual benefit.

One interesting area where there is insufficient cooperation is with men. The PPWE agenda was dominated by women and most delegates were women. The message of PPWE needs to be shared with men, in a way that men understand in order for it to get traction and really make a difference.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> APEC, Guidebook on APEC Projects (v11), 2015, p. 75

## 6. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

## 6.1 Decision points for consideration by SCE

The following are the decision points for consideration by SCE:

## Decision point 1

To continue to promote gender as a cross-cutting issue, and to do so more consistently, across APEC through continuing to support the PPWE, which. is well positioned to provide coordination, technical oversight, monitoring and reporting.

In 2010, Senior Officials endorsed a new *Framework to Guide ECOTECH Activities* to guide APEC-funded capacity building programs.<sup>38</sup> Under this Framework, gender is considered as an issue to be addressed as the cross-cutting priority 'Inclusive growth', and does not stand alone.

The PPWE is the only fora in which gender is raised as a cross-cutting issue and is therefore well positioned to promote gender across APEC.

For PPWE to sustain meaningful progress towards its stated objectives, gender needs to be referred to as a cross-cutting issue consistently.

## **Decision point 2**

To mainstream gender equity across the APEC project cycle.

The *Guidebook on APEC Projects* (currently in the 11<sup>th</sup> edition, 2015) has included a *Guide on Gender Criteria for APEC Project Proposals* since May 2012 (8<sup>th</sup> edition). The *Guide on Gender Criteria was* incorporated into the Guidebook in recognition of the need to overcome the barriers to fully harness the economic integration of women in APEC economies. PPWE has been charged with leading the effort to implement the Guide and to work with other APEC entities to provide effective policy recommendations on women and the economy.

However, the *Guide on Gender Criteria* only applies to the preparation of proposals and Concept Notes. There are no mechanisms for the promotion of the integration of women in the economy across the implementation or review phase of the project cycle.

Rather than incorporating a *Guide on Gender Criteria* as an Annex to the *Guidebook on APEC Projects*, gender needs to be incorporated across the project cycle from design to implementation and evaluation. Indicators need to be incorporated so that APEC can monitor and compare approaches and make adjustments where necessary.

## 6.2 <u>Recommended actions for PPWE</u>

The following are the recommended actions that can be considered for implementation by PPWE:

### **Recommendation 1**

That PPWE review the chair arrangements and consider implementing a 2-year chairing arrangement along the lines of the 'Consolidated Guidelines for the Rotation System for Lead Shepherds and Chairs'.<sup>39</sup>

Under the usual APEC chairing arrangements, in line with APEC guidelines each Working Group and other Fora will select a Lead Shepherd / Chair, who will have a two-year term (two

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> <u>http://www.apec.org/Groups/SOM-Steering-Committee-on-Economic-and-Technical-</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;u>Cooperation.aspx</u> accessed on 7 August 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> APEC, Senior Officials' Report on Economic and Technical Cooperation, 2012, Annex 5, p.43

calendar years). PPWE currently has an annual chair arrangement with the host economy also chairing the PPWE suite of meetings meaning that each economy has an opportunity to lead and actively participate in APEC agenda-setting as well as enhancing PPWE's synergy. It is supported through a Friends of the Chair mechanism and the Troika where the previous and incoming hosts assist with thematic and documentation issues. This arrangement is an important aspect of PPWE, and promotes the diversity that PPWE needs to protect in order to maintain it's rich output.

A rotating two-year chair (on a voluntary basis) would have many benefits including:

- Continuity with more seamless transitioning of the issues from year-to-year,
- Increased efficiency through the oversight of a more experienced chair and increased corporate memory,
- The host economy would be able to concentrate on the logistic and administrative requirements of hosting an APEC fora, and
- The Chair could mentor less experienced and smaller economies.

Separating the chairing role from the hosting role would assist in addressing the problem that smaller economies have with regards to capacity to undertaking both hosting and chairing responsibilities. The co-hosting arrangement may also provide mentoring benefits between the responsible economies.

#### **Recommendation 2**

That a revision of the 'Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC is supported by APEC' and undertaken as soon as possible.

The purpose of the PPWE is to implement the *Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC*. However, the Framework has not been updated since it was published in 1999.

At the time the Framework was published it was innovative and pioneering. Since then, it has contributed to accelerating the progress of integrating women in the mainstream of APEC processes and activities. This was achieved by reinforcing the important role of women in economic development through thee inter-related elements being: gender analysis, collection and use of sex-disaggregated data, and involvement of women in APEC.

While the implementation of these inter-related elements was cutting edge, there has been an increased level of sophistication in how we understand and integrate women's participation. For example, the Framework does not discuss meaningful participation or include mechanisms for the gender mainstreaming or a gender transformative approach.

The revision of the Framework will allow the PPWE to build on its early successes and expand the scope and effectiveness of its work in better promoting the integration of women in the work of APEC.

#### **Recommendation 3**

That a formal lessons learned process is developed for implementation within PPWE and implemented during the PMCM at the end of each WEF.

A formal lessons learned process would provide a mechanism through which insights could be collected, discussed and recorded for use by future hosts. In the current environment, each economy leaves an impression on the implementation of the PPWE. It would be useful if the processes and functions that contributed to achieving the impact were recorded for other economies to benefit from. It would also assist with keeping things in the organisational memory. A lessons learned mechanism could be as simple as an excel spread sheet with select data validation rules, or more complex, such as a database. This could record lessons relating to both administration and logistics, and the broader work undertaken by the PPWE. A selection of issues could include:

- Private sector engagement,
- Feedback for the Chair,
- Meeting scheduling, and
- Efficiencies.

Recorded and coded lessons would provide an important collection of insights for the incoming host and chair, increase efficiency and make a contribution to PPWE obtaining its objectives. This would ideally be undertaken during the PMCM at the conclusion of each PPWE and the PPWE Director could be responsible for the oversight of this database.

#### **Recommendation 4**

That the PPWE makes an annual presentation of its work plan, approach and achievements to a high level within APEC: preferably at SOM III, otherwise at the SCE.

As it stands, PPWE briefs the SCE-COW on its work plan and approach during SOM I at the start of each calendar year. SOM III usually occurs in August, and the PPWE reports its outcomes and deliverables at the WEF HLPD in September.

Regardless of the lack of synchronisation with regards to timing, PPWE is charged with the implementation of a cross – cutting issue for APEC. PPWE's tasks include the need to promote and report on women's representation across APEC; actively co-operate with other APEC fora; share best practice; and report on progress of implementation of gender integration. The Guidebook on APEC Projects states that: "The PPWE acts as an institutional mechanism for reporting to the Steering Committee on ECOTECH (SCE) on APEC gender activities and outcomes."

An opportunity to present a statement of achievements regularly at a high level, mixed fora environment would assist PPWE in implementing the tasking statement in its Terms of Reference. It would also assist in mainstreaming gender across the APEC fora by increasing both the accountability of PPWE to its Terms of Reference, and other fora to the integration of women in APEC.

In 2013, PPWE made a presentation to the SCE that was very successful. The presentation was brief and outlined the PPWE agenda and explained how it could assist other APEC fora. This is a good example and demonstrated that for PPWE's message to be accepted at this level, the PPWE delegate charged with the responsibility of delivering the report needs to high level, and the meeting in which the PPWE message is presented needs to be carefully chosen.

### **Recommendation 5**

That a representative from PPWE is highly encouraged to attend the meetings of other fora to present a progress report on the integration of women in APEC, and that likewise, all other fora are encouraged to present their report on their groups' progress in integrating women in APEC.

Gender is a cross-cutting issue within APEC, therefore cooperation with other APEC Fora is a critical element of PPWE's work. This is specifically expressed throughout PPWE policy and guiding documentation. For example, the first of PPWE's eight tasks outlined in its Terms of

Reference is to assist APEC fora and *actively cooperate* with them to identify and access priority gender equality and women and the economy issues within their work.

PPWE has been working effectively to develop and implement projects specifically aimed to promote cooperation and increase women's integration. For example, the APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard, and the WE-APEC initiative.<sup>40</sup> Reporting and updating other working groups through their fora would be an effective and cost efficient form of promotion for PPWE and would increase accountability across the working groups.

There are 17 APEC fora, which could potentially make this an expensive undertaking. Therefore cost effective solutions need to be applied such as video link (both for PPWE to share with other Working Groups and as a mode for other Working Groups to participate in PPWE). Alternatively, the host economy could send representatives that could then report back to PPWE. In addition to promoting gender as a cross-cutting issue, this would provide learning opportunities. Lessons from other working groups could be shared during the PMCM and recorded in the lessons learned database.

#### **Recommendation 6**

That PPWE develop and implement a communication strategy, addressing both inter-PPWE communication needs as well as extra-PPWE communication.

A simple internal communication strategy needs to be developed and implemented across PPWE. This strategy needs to include a timing schedule for the following:

- PPWE, PPDWE and HLPD on WE agendas. These need to be developed earlier, and perhaps even be part of the discussion at PMCM the preceding year, and finalized via teleconference,
- Submission of workshops and events on the margin,
- A report on PPWE to be tabled at the APEC Leaders Meeting, along with the Statement, and
- Reports need to be uploaded on APEC and WEF websites, including links to this section from other fora web pages. Email alerts can be sent to all focal points as and when new information and updates are uploaded into the websites.

The communication matrix also needs to map a plan and strategy to disseminate the PPWE message externally. The PPWE Strategic Plan outlines an external communication strategy in Objective One. Targets include:

- 1. By APEC Economic Leaders' Meeting (AELM) 2015, publish first report of baseline indicators with a follow up [workshop or conference?] on recommendations for action in specific areas in the PPWE's five priority pillars;
- 2. By AELM 2015, disseminate results of the APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard workshop to all APEC fora;
- 3. By AELM 2018, evidence-based gender responsive policy recommendations are integrated into relevant APEC activities and statements, including across at least 10 APEC fora consistent with objective number 2; and

<sup>40</sup> http://www.we-apec.com

4. Annual Women and the Economy Forums conducted and statements disseminated and follow up action discussed in priority APEC fora, including SOM, SCE and working groups.<sup>41</sup>

These targets should be set out in a matrix and need to include more simple communication planning for issues such as responding to other fora request.

### **Recommendation 7**

*That the PPWE components are collectively referred to as the Women and the Economy Fora (WEF).* 

PPWE is a part of a suite of activities occurring under the Women and the Economy Fora. At the time that PPWE was initiated, this suite of activities was called the Women and the Economy Summit. Later it was known as the Women and the Economy Forum. Mostly the PPWE agenda is simply referred to as 'Women and the Economy'.

Consistency in nomenclature would save PPWE time that could be invested in advocacy and promotion. It would also benefit the PPWE agenda is it would be titled (and therefore understood) in a way consistent to other APEC working groups.

#### **Recommendation 8**

That the PPWE work towards achieving greater gender equity in the WEF and engage more men as champions of change.

The work of PPWE, and the suite of PPWE meetings, is dominated by women. This is a lost opportunity for PPWE. The PPWE and HLPD on WE are important forums where critical issues pertaining to the integration of women and the economy are discussed. The workshops are also important forums for the dissemination of information and ideas. Through increasing the attendance of men, and maintaining an affirming, results focussed forum, PPWE would be increasing opportunities to promote women's economic empowerment.

### **Recommendation 9**

That private sector engagement in PPWE and HLPD on WE is increased and that the private sector have a greater degree of input in the development of work plans and the Statement.

The PPWE Fora is based on the private sector WLN initiative reaching back over twenty years ago. For PPWE to make a genuine contribution towards creating a strong, sustainable, balanced economic growth in the APEC region that is more inclusive and enabling for women to succeed and advance, it is critical that both the private and public aspects of PPWE can equally benefit.

In the current format, a satisfactory level of mutual benefit is achieved from the PPDWE, but the same level of mutual benefit is not being transferred across to the PPWE and HLDP on WE. Initiatives that could be incorporated to address this could include:

- A parallel private public PPWE where the public sector discuss their work plan input separately to the public sector and then meet for a joint session,
- Equal representation of the private public sector at the delegates table,
- Equal representation on the chairing panel; greater private sector contribution at the HLDP on WE (especially at the chair), and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> APEC, *PPWE Strategic Plan 2015 – 2018*, 2015, p. 1
• Increasing meeting efficiency regarding the development of the Statement and work plan reporting.

#### **Recommendation 10**

#### That the PPWE engage more closely with ABAC.

ABAC has four meetings a year with the final meeting in the host economy and in the same location as the Leaders Dialogue, so that they can meet the leaders that have appointed them.

ABAC is an active participant in PPWE, mainly through the public private dialogue. ABAC is also represented at the PMCM and therefore involved in discussions on relevant issues related to the execution and effectiveness of PPWE are discussed. PPWE is also successful in providing mechanisms for informal communication among ABAC and business delegations.

Cooperation with ABAC would improve if there was a stronger communication mechanism between ABAC and PPWE. This would mean that PPWE could share potential joint activities to avoid replication of efforts, and to cover wider scope of audience in advancing women's economic participation in APEC.

PPWE would also benefit from seeking input from ABAC regarding recommendations on experts and entrepreneurs to participate in PPDWE, PPWE and workshops.

#### **Recommendation 11**

That the gender-disaggregated data continues to be collected and recorded by APEC with a view to monitoring and analyzing it in the future.

APEC has been collecting gender-disaggregated data through the implementation of APEC projects since 1999. This data should be standardized across working groups to record issues such as the degree of women's participation in both paid and unpaid activity, leadership and training which then should be monitored and analyzed.

## APPENDIX A – APEC WORKING GROUPS

Working Group	Relevance to APEC objectives	Working Group Objectives	Current Priorities
Agricultural Technology Cooperation	Contribution of agriculture to APEC economies.	To enhance agriculture's contribution to the region's economic growth and social well-being.	To improve capacity of agriculture and related industries and to share information in agriculture, biotechnology, and animal and biogenetic resource management.
Anti-Corruption and Transparency	Reduce the threat to good governance and economic growth in the Asia-Pacific.	To coordinate the implementation of Santiago Commitment, APEC Course of Action and APEC Transparency Standards.	To implement the UN Convention Against Corruption.
Counter Terrorism	Secure the region's people and its economic, trade, investment and financial systems from terrorist attack or abuse and trade- based money laundering.	To coordinate commitments on fighting terrorism and enhancing human security; assist members to identify and assess counter-terrorism needs; coordinate capacity building and technical assistance programs.	
Disability Issues*	Promoting disability- inclusive development in the Asia-Pacific region.	To promote information- sharing and understanding, participation, and cooperation for persons with disabilities in the Asia-Pacific region.	Establishment of a Group of Friends on Disability Issues.
Emergency Preparedness	Enhancing human security and reducing the threat of disruptions to business and trade.	To enable the region to better prepare for and respond to emergencies and disasters.	To build capacity in relation to emergencies and disasters, and collaboration on emergency preparedness issues.
Energy	Further APEC goals to facilitate energy- related-trade and investment.	To maximize energy sector's contribution to APEC's economic and social well- being, while mitigating environmental effects of energy supply and use.	To ensure energy security, removing barriers to energy trade and investment, facilitating LNG trade, promoting new and renewable energy, energy efficiency, and smart communities, keeping up safe nuclear power development, and cooperating on clean fossil fuel.
Health	Address multi- sectoral impacts of health threats.	To address health-related threats to economies' trade and security, focusing mainly on emerging infectious diseases.	To provide policy guidance, align activities with ECOTECH priorities, address life sciences and innovation.
Human Resource Development	Promote well-being of all people and achieve sustainable and inclusive economic growth.	To build the region's human capacity and achieving this goal.	To develop initiatives on education, labour and capacity building to develop human resources.
Illegal Logging and Associated Trade (Experts Group)	Enhance cooperation to address concerns with illegal logging and associated trade.	To enable member economies to strengthen policy dialogue on combating illegal logging and associated trade and promoting trade in legally harvested forest products.	To exchange information on policies, regulations, governance and law enforcement relating to combating illegal logging and promoting trade in legal forest products.

Working Group	Relevance to APEC objectives	Working Group Objectives	Current Priorities
Mining Task Force	Regulated mining and metallurgical operations that are sustainable and contribute to the well-being and livelihoods in APEC economies.	Support the capacity of local businesses, mining industry and/or regulators in developing member economies, enhance the trade and investment environment for mining and contribute to APEC objectives for women's economic empowerment.	To promote closer cooperation of the mining sector in the Asia Pacific region, innovation-driven growth, and social responsibility and common development.
Ocean and Fisheries	Facilitate trade and investment opportunities that promote the sustainable use of fisheries, aquaculture, and marine ecosystem resources.	To exchange information and help foster institutional capacity building; advance discussions and the development of solutions for common resource management problems and share best practices.	Measures to establish a more integrated and sustainable ocean partnership in the region.
Science Technology and Innovation**	APEC's primary forum to engage government, private sector and academia in joint scientific research.	To enhance economic growth, trade and investment opportunities, as well as social progress, in harmony with sustainability.	Strengthen collaboration and enhance innovative capacity; develop science, research and technology cooperation; build human capacity; support infrastructure for commercialization of ideas; develop innovation policy frameworks and foster an enabling environment for innovation.
Small and Medium Enterprises	Contribution of SMEs to APEC economies.	To encourage the development of SMEs and to build their capacity to engage in international trade.	To build management capability, financing and business environment.
Telecommun- ications and Information	Building confidence and security in the use of ICT to promote economic growth and prosperity.	To improve telecommunications and information infrastructure in the Asia-Pacific to become an information society.	Telecommunications regulations liberalisation, development and implementation of advanced information and communications technologies, promoting security in these technologies.
Tourism	Sustainable tourism as an economic driver.	To share information and exchange of views and development of cooperation.	Removal of impediments to tourism, increasing mobility, sustainable management of tourism, enhance understanding of tourism as a means of economic development.
Transportation	Liberalisation of Transport Services; enhanced safety of transport systems.	Efficient and safe transportation of Goods and People.	Harmonisation of security measures, capacity building in security and safety compliance, liberalisation of air services.
Women and the Economy**	Promote greater inclusion of women in the regional economy. f Eriends	To advance the economic integration of women in the APEC region.	Focus on women's access to capital, access to markets, skills and capacity building, leadership and agency, innovation and technology.

\*

Group of Friends Policy Partnerships \*\*

### APPENDIX B – METHOD

This is the forth of four independent assessments that Sustineo has been engaged to undertake on behalf of the APEC Secretariat. In order to develop a comparable body of work, this review builds on the approach and presentation of the 2015 Independent Assessment of the Policy Partnership on Science, Technology and Innovation.

The detailed steps of the Method are as follows:

#### 1. Understanding of APEC's goals

Review of APEC key documents, APEC goals/objectives and procedures, other official and non-official assessments of APEC work including ECOTECH goals.

#### 2. Review and research PPWE's objectives and activities

Review of PPWE key documents, including the Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC, agenda papers from PPWE meetings held from 2011 to 2015, and statements by APEC associated with the PPWE's evolution from WLN, AGGI, and GFPN.

Review of Leaders' and Ministers statements, PPWE records of meetings, key project documentation and workshop activities to assess the outcomes and how PPWE supports the main objectives/goals of APEC.

#### 3. Survey

A short online survey of PPWE economy representatives was developed in consultation with the PPWE Program Director. Respondents were asked to complete the survey online by 30 June, but due to the low response rate this was extended to 30 July. Summary answers from the survey are contained in Appendix C – Written Survey.

Face-to-face discussions were undertaken with member economies during the PPWE meetings held in Lima, Peru over 27 to 30 June 2016. Follow-up discussions were held with member economies unable to attend PPWE meeting either in person or via telephone. Notes were taken during each interview and have been referred to in compiling the assessment.

#### 4. Draft Assessment

A draft assessment was submitted in mid August 2016 to the PPWE Program Director and APEC Secretariat for comment on factual matters. The Program Director also circulated the draft assessment to member economies for comment by 15 September 2016. These comments were incorporated into the final assessment and significant comments were analysed. The final draft report was finalised by end September 2016. The draft final report was delivered to SCE in xxxx of 2016]

### **APPENDIX C – WRITTEN SURVEY**

A survey was distributed to all 21 APEC economies. Data was collected from 11, including Canada; Japan; Mexico; New Zealand; Singapore; the Philippines; Russia and Thailand.

#### PPWE's Current Performance

**Question 1** – As outlined in the PPWE Terms of Reference, it was established in 2011 to provide a streamlined and effective mechanism to integrate gender equality, women and the economy considerations, and elevate the influence of women's economic issues in APEC. What do you think are the three main existing initiatives that could support this?

Most important initiative*	2nd most important initiative*	3rd most important initiative*
lf not known, record "unknown"		

\* Note – Question 1 and 2 will be open-ended responses to allow participants to identify the most important initiatives that they are aware of.

**Question 2** – As outlined in the PPWE Terms of Reference, its purpose is to advance the <u>Framework for the Integration of Women</u> in APEC based on the principle that gender equality is a cross-cutting issues within APEC. Name the top three initiatives that you consider to have been important in supporting this purpose.

Most important initiative	2nd most important initiative	3rd most important initiative

**Question 3** – As outlined in the PPWE Terms of Reference, the PPWE will conduct eight basic tasks. Please indicate how well you think these tasks are being achieved. Please rate on a scale from "Not at all" (1) to "Very well" (5), with the midpoint neutral (3).\*

No.	Task	Rating
1	Assist APEC fora and actively cooperate with them to identify and address priority gender equality and women and the economy issues within their work, including inviting the Chairs of the relevant sub-fora to the PPWE meetings to discuss issues that are relevant to each group.	
2	Promote and report on women's representation across APEC and within individual fora.	
3	Assess the use of gender equality criteria in project proposals, reporting and evaluation, revising the gender equality criteria, where appropriate and seek to ensure that at least one secretariat representative from member economies has specific gender equality and women in the economy expertise at all times.	
4	Collect and share best practices in gender equality integration amongst fora and on an annual basis select one topic area of best practice to be featured at the PPWE meeting.	
5	Support and report on the progress of implementation of gender integration within individual fora and across APEC economies, including following up on the implementation of policy recommendations on women and the economy called for by APEC Leadership.	
6	Proactively engage with and share information to key members of PPWE, including private sector members and APEC Business Advisory Council (ABAC), especially the host economy ABAC member to be selected to be PPWE Women and the Economy advisor, as well as other relevant stakeholders, including	

No.	Task	Rating
	international organizations, to advance women's economic empowerment in APEC.	
7	Collaborate/assist in the development of project proposals in the area of women in the economy.	
8	Propose recommendations and areas of priority for advancing gender equality and women and the economy integration in APEC.	

\*Note – this and other questions asked for responses on a Likert scale from "Not at all" to "Very well", with the midpoint neutral. These were converted to scores of between 1 (Not at all) to 5 (Very well) and are presented as averages for these and similar questions. 3 is neutral, higher is better

**Question 4** – The PPWE Strategic Plan was adopted in 2015. It will advance the implementation of the *Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC* agenda through progressing a number of objectives. Objective One is *Strengthen the integration of gender responsive policies and programs across APEC fora*. Targets have already been met for this Objective that include *"disseminate results of the APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard workshop to all APEC fora."* In your opinion, what initiatives could be undertaken to strengthen the Dashboard so it can support the integration of gender responsive policies and programs across APEC fora?

Most important initiative	2nd most important initiative	3rd most important initiative

**Question 5** – In the PPWE Strategic Plan, Objective Two is Advance women's economic participation through five priority pillars. In your opinion, what initiatives would best support the implementation of cross-fora programs and activities through the implementation of this objective?

Most important initiative	2nd most important initiative	3rd most important initiative

**Question 6** – In the PPWE Strategic Plan, Objective Three is *Strengthen the foundation and operating structure of the PPWE and the Women and the Economy Forum.* In your opinion, how what initiatives would best support this objective?

Most important initiative	2nd most important initiative	3rd most important initiative

**Question 7** – The PPWE Strategic Plan cites eight critical success factors for the successful attainment of the Mission Statement and Objectives. Please rate how well these are being positioned to meet these factors and provide best practice examples.

Critical success factor	Rating*	Best practice example
Communications		
Coordination		
Linkages		
Leadership		

Critical success factor	Rating*	Best practice example
Resources		
Partnership		
Reporting		
Awareness and commitment		

\*Note – this and other questions asked for responses on a Likert scale from "Not at all" to "Very well", with the midpoint neutral. These were converted to scores of between 1 (Not at all) to 5 (Very well) and are presented as averages for these and similar questions. 3 is neutral, higher is better

**Question 8** – Please suggest ways to improve action on any items above which you ranked "Not at all" or "Not well"

Responses:

#### PPWE and Other APEC Fora

**Question 9** – PPWE aims, among other things, to assist other APEC fora to help them identify and address priority gender equality and women and the economy issues within their work. Please rank the relative importance of the following APEC fora to PPWE's existing work (1 is highest, 14 lowest, n/a if considered not applicable)

APEC Forum	Ave. rank	Potential initiatives suggested
Agricultural Technical Cooperation		
Anti-Corruption and Transparency		
Counter-Terrorism		
Emergency Preparedness		
Energy		
Health		
Human Resources Development		
Illegal Logging and Associate Trade		
Ocean and Fisheries		
Policy Partnership on Science, Technology and Innovation		
Small and Medium Enterprises		
Telecommunications and Information		
Tourism		

APEC Forum	Ave. rank	Potential initiatives suggested
Transportation		

#### **PPWE and External Organisations**

**Question 10** – APEC is encouraged to engage in greater collaboration with non-APEC parties including the private sector, civil society and other international organizations. In relation to the PPWE, please indicate whether you agree or disagree whether any of the following initiatives will achieve this.

Answer Options	Average Score
Non-APEC parties participation in PPWE workshops	
Non-APEC parties leading of PPWE workshops	
Roundtable events involving non-APEC parties	
Non-APEC parties involvement in development of the annual work plan	
Connections with non-APEC associations	
Non-APEC parties participation in economy delegations	
Specific engagement with women in business/ industry organisations, women's chambers of commerce and industry etc	

\*Likert scale question, 3 is neutral, higher is better

**Question 11** - Please provide details of one initiative by organisations other than PPWE which has been, in your opinion, successful in strengthening ties between an APEC forum and non-APEC parties. Please note why you think this initiative has been successful.

Responses:

#### ABAC and ECOTECH Priorities

**Question 12** – The PPWE Strategic Plan objectives include cooperation and partnering activities with ABAC. What specific activities of the PPWE involve the ABAC?

#### **Responses:**

**Question 13** – What, if any, aspects of the PPWE engagement with ABAC are working well? Responses:

**Question 14** – What, if any, aspects of the PPWE engagement with ABAC could be improved? Responses:

**Question 15** - In 2010, APEC Senior Officials endorsed a new Framework to guide APECfunded capacity building and all ECOTECH activities. Please identify what recent initiatives of PPWE have supported the following medium-term ECOTECH priorities.

Priority	Initiative
Regional Economic Integration	
Addressing the social dimensions of globalisation	
Safeguarding the quality of life through sustainable growth	
Structural reform	
Human security	

**Question 16** - Please comment on any areas where you feel that PPWE has failed to support APEC's ECOTECH priorities as listed above.

Responses:

**Question 17** – Rank the following barriers to meeting APEC's ECOTECH objectives from PPWE's perspective.

Barrier	Average rank in descending order of importance
Lack of central funds for PPWE projects	
Lack of engagement initiated by PPWE with other APEC fora	
Lack of engagement initiated by other APEC fora with PPPWE	
Lack of industry involvement with PPWE's work plan	
Lack of non-APEC party (e.g. private sector, civil society) involvement with PPWE's Strategic Plan	
Lack of support from ABAC	
Lack of self-funding of PPWE projects from individual economies	
Unwillingness of other APEC fora to engage with PPWE	
Unequal engagement of women members of the community	

# **Question 18** -Are there any other barriers to PPWE's ability to meet APEC's ECOTECH objectives (apart from those listed in Q17)?

Responses:

**Question 19** – APEC's Tasking Statement for 2015 set the actions required listed below for PPWE. How well do you think that PPWE is working towards addressing these?

Action required	Average score*
Commit to stabilizing and expanding employment, implementing macroeconomic policies in favour of job creation, and strengthening capacity building for human resources development, vocational skills development and skill training for youth.	

Make efforts to implement training programs for skills development for women and young people, fostering an enabling environment to create better quality jobs; establish capacity building centers to help workers achieve competencies required to meet industry demand.	
Sustain momentum from economies to provide policy support for women's economic empowerment and establish a gender- responsive enabling environment to advance women's full and equal economic participation, including in women's access to jobs, capital, markets, business networks, skills and capacity building, and innovation and technology.	
Take forward actions to launch a Women's Entrepreneurship in APEC (WE-APEC) entrepreneurship network.	
Establish the APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard as an important step in tracking women's ability to participate in the economy in the APEC region and task the PSU with producing the first Women and the Economy Dashboard in 2015.	
Task the APEC Policy Partnership on Women and Economy (PPWE) to collaborate with other APEC fora to incorporate a gender perspective into APEC's work; and encourage cross-fora synergies wherever possible, including with greater private sector engagement, collaboration and sharing of best practice data.	

\*Likert scale question, 3 is neutral, higher is better

**Question 20** - Please suggest one way that one of the areas (if any) that you have ranked poorly or extremely poorly in Question 21 (above) can be improved.

Responses:

Priorities	Suggestions
Developing human capital through capacity building	
Developing and strengthening the dynamism of Small and Medium Enterprises	
Harnessing technologies for the future and supporting innovation	
Regional economics integration	
Structural reform	

**Question 21** – The APEC medium-term priorities listed below have been recommended for adoption in 2015-19. Please list ways that, in your view, PPWE could support these priorities.

#### PPWE's Efficiency

**Question 22** – PPWE is served by a Secretariat based in Singapore. For each statement pleased indicate your level of agreement to the following questions which relate to the efficiency of the Secretariat

Efficiency measure	Average
	score*

Meeting agenda documents are made available within a short time of their receipt by the secretariatImage: Comparison of the secretariatAfter each meeting, summaries and other meeting outcome documents are made available promptly on the APEC meeting document siteImage: Comparison of the secretariatMeetings are managed smoothlyImage: Comparison of the secretarianImage: Comparison of the secretarianMeetings run to timeImage: Comparison of the meeting agenda is well matched to the aims and objectives of the PPWEImage: Comparison of the secretarianThere is sufficient funding available for the PPWE's projectsImage: Comparison of the secretarian of the secretarian of the secretarian of the meeting periods where childcare is available)Meetings are structured in a way that accommodates participation by women (such as adequate toilet breaks, and arranged during periods where childcare is available)Image: Comparison of the secretarianMeetings are scheduled to allow direct liaison between APEC fora where there is a common linkageImage: Comparison of the secretarian of the PPWE meet your economy's needs		
available promptly on the APEC meeting document siteMeetings are managed smoothlyMeetings run to timeThe number of documents provided for each meeting is manageableThe structure of the meeting agenda is well matched to the aims and objectives of the PPWEPPWEThere is sufficient funding available for the PPWE's projectsMeetings are structured in a way that accommodates participation by women (such as adequate toilet breaks, and arranged during periods where childcare is available)Meetings are scheduled to allow direct liaison between APEC fora where there is a common linkage		
Meetings run to time		
The number of documents provided for each meeting is manageable    The structure of the meeting agenda is well matched to the aims and objectives of the PPWE    There is sufficient funding available for the PPWE's projects    Meetings are structured in a way that accommodates participation by women (such as adequate toilet breaks, and arranged during periods where childcare is available)    Meetings are scheduled to allow direct liaison between APEC fora where there is a common linkage	Meetings are managed smoothly	
The structure of the meeting agenda is well matched to the aims and objectives of the PPWE    There is sufficient funding available for the PPWE's projects    Meetings are structured in a way that accommodates participation by women (such as adequate toilet breaks, and arranged during periods where childcare is available)    Meetings are scheduled to allow direct liaison between APEC fora where there is a common linkage	Meetings run to time	
PPWE	The number of documents provided for each meeting is manageable	
Meetings are structured in a way that accommodates participation by women (such as adequate toilet breaks, and arranged during periods where childcare is available) Meetings are scheduled to allow direct liaison between APEC fora where there is a common linkage		
as adequate toilet breaks, and arranged during periods where childcare is available) Meetings are scheduled to allow direct liaison between APEC fora where there is a common linkage	There is sufficient funding available for the PPWE's projects	
common linkage		
The current administrative arrangements for the PPWE meet your economy's needs		
	The current administrative arrangements for the PPWE meet your economy's needs	

\*Likert scale question, 3 is neutral, higher is better

**Question 23** – Please suggest ways to improve action on any items from Q22 above which you ranked "Disagree" or "Strongly disagree".

Responses:

**Question 24** – What do you suggest, if anything, that would make the PPWE Secretariat more efficient than it is today?

Responses:

**Question 25** – What would improve the process of developing the annual work plan for the PPWE?

Responses:

**Question 26** – Is there a PPWE-specific process to enable quantitative and/or qualitative measurement of approved projects/ programmes?

Responses:

**Question 27** – If you answered yes to Q26, are the results of this research used to modify projects/ programmes to achieve maximum results?

Responses:

Question 28 – Characteristics of respondents

Responses:

### **APPENDIX D – FACE-TO-FACE SURVEY**

#### PPWE Independent review – guide for face-to-face interview

All member economies attending the meeting in Lima, Peru in June 2016 were met and encouraged to complete the online survey. In addition, specific discussions were undertaken with a number of member economies during the workshop or in the weeks following. Where the delegation also answered the written survey, contact may have been made to clarify or expand on some of the issues raised.

- 1. Introduction to the discussion -how long respondents have been on PPWE, general background, describe purpose of the face-to-face as supplementary to the survey.
- 2. With the annual rotation of Chair, can you please comment on the continuity and support provided to incoming Chairs, particularly if they have not previously been involved in the Working Group.
- 3. What overlaps (if any) do you see between PPWE and other APEC working groups?
- 4. What are your comments on the implementation of the Strategic Plan?
- 5. How can the public private sector aspect of PPWE be improved?

In addition to the completed online survey, discussions were undertaken with the following economies and delegations:

- Members of the delegations of Australia; Canada; Chile; People's Republic of China; Indonesia; Papua New Guinea; Peru; the Philippines; Russia; Singapore; Chinese Taipei; United States; Viet Nam and ABAC.
- Project Director for PPWE
- Chair of the APEC Secretariat.

### **APPENDIX E – SOURCE DOCUMENTS**

The following documents were reviewed for information on PPWE's and APEC's terms of reference, objective including: Leaders and Minister's statements; and PPWE Records of Meetings. Key project documentation and activities are detailed in the tables below.

Document No. / date	Title	Submitted By
1999	Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC	APEC

Document No / date	Title	Session	Submitted By
13 September 2011	SUMMARY REPORT - 1 <sup>st</sup> MEETING OF THE APEC PPWE	1st	San Francisco, United States
2011/GFPN/WKSP/004	Setting the APEC Context	1	APEC Secretariat
2011/GFPN/WKSP/025	Small Group Discussions	-	United States
2011/GFPN/WKSP/026	Session 5 – Additional Reading: Microfinance Banana Skins 2011 - The Centre for the Study of Financial Innovation (CSFI) Survey of Microfinance Risk	5	Opportunity International
2011/GFPN/WKSP/027	Session 5 – Additional Reading: Risky Business: An Empirical Analysis of Foreign Exchange Risk Exposure in Microfinance	5	Opportunity International
2011/GFPN/WKSP/028	Session 5 – Additional Reading: The Global Microscope on the Microfinance Business Environment 2010	5	Opportunity International
2011/GFPN/WKSP/029	Session 5 – Additional Reading: Same Game, Different League: What Microfinance Institutions Can Learn from the Large Banks Corporate Government Debate	5	Opportunity International
2011	Leaders' Declaration		APEC
2011	Guidebook on APEC Projects		APEC

Document No. / date	Title	Submitted By
August 2012	Independent Assessment on the PPWE	Independent
2012	Leaders' Declaration	APEC

Document No.	Title	Submitted By
2013/PPWE/WEF/001	Agenda – Women and the Economy Forum 2013	Indonesia
2013/PPWE/001	Draft Agenda	Indonesia
2013	Leaders' Declaration	APEC

Document No.	Title	Submitted By
2014/PPWE/DIA/000	Document List - Public-Private Dialogue on Women and the Economy 2014	APEC Secretariat
2014/PPWE/DIA/001	Draft Agenda - Public-Private Dialogue on Women and the Economy 2014	PPWE Chair
2014	Leaders' Declaration	APEC

Document No.	Title	Submitted By	
2015/PPWE2/WKSP2/0 00	Document Classification List - Women and the Economy Dashboard: Developing an Implementation Plan 2015	APEC Secretariat	
2015/PPWE2/WKSP2/0 01	Agenda - Women and the Economy Dashboard: Developing an Implementation Plan 2015	United States	
2015/PPWE2/WKSP2/0 02	Overview of Women and the Economy Dashboard 2 PSU	APEC Secretariat	
2015/PPWE2/WKSP2/0 03	APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard 2 PSU,	APEC Secretariat	
2015/PPWE2/WKSP2/0 04	APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard Executive Summary 2 PSU,	APEC Secretariat	
2015/PPWE2/WKSP2/0 05	APEC Women and the Economy Dashboard Action Plan Template: Setting Goals and Measuring Progress in Implementing Selected Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE) Priorities 3	United States	
2015/PPWE2/DIA1/001	Agenda - Public Private Dialogue on Women and the Economy 2015	PPWE Chair	
2015/PPWE2/DIA1/002 a	Welcome Remarks	Philippines	
2015/PPWE2/DIA1/002 b	Setting the Tone for Public Private Dialogue on Women and the Economy 2015	Philippines	
2015/PPWE2/DIA1/003	Opening Speech	ABAC	
2015/PPWE2/DIA1/004	Speech of the President of the Philippines	Philippines	
2015	PPWE Strategic Plan 2015 – 2018	APEC Secretariat	
2015	PPWE Terms of Reference	APEC	
2015	Guidebook on APEC Projects (v11)	APEC	
2015	Guide on Gender Criteria for APEC Project Proposals	APEC	
2015	Leaders' Declaration	APEC	

Document No.	Title	Submitted By	
2016	Implementation of the APEC Dashboard	United States	

### **APPENDIX F – PPWE PUBLICATIONS**

#### In date order

# Good Practices on Economic Empowerment of Women in Post-Disaster Reconstruction in Tohoku and the Asia-Pacific (2015) APEC#215-ES-01.3

In light of ongoing global and regional discussions and commitments, this report intends to highlight good practices aimed at empowering women economically in the post-disaster situations, particularly through entrepreneurship and innovation, drawing lessons for collective learning. This paper also explore the factors which contribute to the successful implementation of the project from the gender perspective.

#### How ICT Economically Empower Women Entrepreneurs (2015) APEC#214-ES-01.10

This report presents research findings generated from first-hand data gathered from past reviews and ongoing projects aimed at harnessing ICT-enabled tools designed to enable, or advance, the economic empowerment of women in four APEC partner economies  $\hat{a} \in C$  Chile; the Republic of Korea; the Philippines; and Chinese Taipei.

#### 50 Leading Companies for Women in APEC (2014) APEC#214-PP-01.1

Building upon the APEC's Growth Strategy of 2010 and other APEC activities, this project seeks to provide support for increased career and economic opportunities for women in the APEC region and beyond.

#### Access to Trade and Growth of Women's SMEs in APEC Developing Economies (2013) APEC#213-PP-01.1

Research for this project aimed to highlight the complex array of factors affecting women in business through a mix of quantitative and qualitative methods. A quantitative survey targeted SME owners in domestic and exporting firms, half of whom were women. Qualitative methods included focus group discussions, semi-structured interviews and case studies.

#### Women's Micro-enterprise Trade Network Pilot (2012) APEC#212-PP-01.1

The report examines some of the conditions necessary to assist women-owned microenterprises in the region find and enter new markets, with a particular focus on women microenterprise owners in rural, remote and Indigenous communities who experience significant challenges to access markets

#### Promoting Sustainable, Market-based Microfinance: Viet Nam Case Study and Lessons Learned for APEC Economies (2011) APEC#211-SO-01.4

This report is part of an APEC program to showcase best practices in microfinance. It aims to identify how microfinance is used in Viet Nam, an APEC economy, and the steps that Viet Nam can take to make microfinance for the poor commercially viable. It also aims to inform discussion among policymakers and practitioners of microfinance throughout the APEC region about best practices in market-based models in microfinance targeting the underserved, including women entrepreneurs.

#### *Promoting Commercially Sustainable Microfinance for the Underserved (2011) APEC#211-SO-01.3*

The purpose of this report is to provide a summary of the issues raised at the APEC Workshop on Microfinance Best Practices held in Ha Noi, Viet Nam, 7-8 April 7-8 2011. This workshop was part of a strategic SMEWG/GFPN project showcasing microfinance best practices, with a focus on women entrepreneurs. The workshop examined ways to improve access to finance in both transitional APEC economies and APEC economies with market based microfinance sectors.

## **APPENDIX G – DETAILED LIST OF PPWE'S PROJECTS IN APEC PROJECT DATABASE**

Project title	Project number	Project	Proposing	Co-sponsoring	Sponsoring fora	Non-APEC
		year	economy	economies		stakeholders
Evaluating Business Environments to Foster Access	GFPN 01 2011A	2011	United		Gender Focal Point Network	
to Trade and Growth of Women's SMEs in Southeast			States		(GFPN)	
Asian APEC Developing Economies						
Women's Micro-enterprise Trade Network Pilot	GFPN 02 2011A	2011	Chinese		Gender Focal Point Network	
Project			Taipei		(GFPN)	
Innovation for Women and Economic Development -	M SCE 03 2013A	2013	Chinese		Policy Partnership on Women	
Facilitating Women's Livelihood Development and			Taipei		and the Economy (PPWE)	
Resilience with ICTs						
50 Leading Companies for Women in APEC	PPWE 01 2014S	2014	Japan		Policy Partnership on Women	
					and the Economy (PPWE)	
APEC Women's Business and Smart Technology	PPWE 02 2014S	2014	Korea		Policy Partnership on Women	
Seminar - Empowering APEC Women's Economic					and the Economy (PPWE)	
Performance using Smart Technology: Supporting						
Policies and Training						
Survey and Workshop to Share Best Practices of	PPWE 03 2014S	2014	Japan		Policy Partnership on Women	
Women's Enterpreneurship in Local Communities in					and the Economy (PPWE)	
the Process of Disaster Reconstruction						
Gap Analysis Toward Development of a Women's	PPWE 04 2014S	2014	United		Policy Partnership on Women	
Entrepreneurship in APEC (WE-APEC) Network			States		and the Economy (PPWE)	
Successful Cases of Women-Owned Small and	PPWE 01 2015A	2015	Chile		Policy Partnership on Women	
Medium Enterprises (SMEs) in Foreign Trade					and the Economy (PPWE)	
Implementation of the APEC Dashboard: Increasing	PPWE 01 2016S	2016	United		Policy Partnership on Women	
STEM Education			States		and the Economy (PPWE)	
Good Practices on Gender Diversity in Corporate	PPWE 02 2016S	2016	Japan		Policy Partnership on Women	
Leadership for Growth					and the Economy (PPWE)	

Source: <a href="https://aimp2.apec.org/sites/PDB/FormServerTemplates/BasicSearch.aspx">https://aimp2.apec.org/sites/PDB/FormServerTemplates/BasicSearch.aspx</a> accessed on 18 June 2016